



Empowered lives. Resilient nations.

EQUAL ACCESS TO JUSTICE THROUGH ENABLING ENVIRONMENT FOR VULNERBALE GROUPS

INCLUSIVE GOVERNANCE FOR SDG 16 IMPLEMENTATION (PHASE II OF UN ONE PROGRAMME)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Building on the progress of the Phase I, the Phase II of the UN One Programme will reinforce the collaboration with partners from the government, civil society including the vulnerable groups on the legislative and policy advocacy and capacity building. This phase will build synergy between the Bhutanese justice sector strategy and the Phase II of the Legal Sector Programme such that the synergies will be mainstreamed into the Bhutan's next five-year plan, i.e. the 12th Five Year Plan. This Phase also contributes to all six National Key Result Areas of Governance pillar of the 11th Five Year Plan. This project, captures UNDP's support to the RGOB in integration of SDG 16 on peace and justice, SDG 10 on inequality, and SDG 5 on gender to advance harmonious and GNH-focused way to measure democratic governance results in Bhutan.

Through this project, UNDP will further enhance its partnerships to deliver three outcome results, eight outputs and related activities to achieve the results. The three outcomes are (i) Evidence-based, inclusive decision-making and policy development is advanced, towards a single policy framework on governance that measures both GNH and SDG results, where no-one is left behind (ii) The Rule of Law and related institutions are strengthened for enhanced access to justice for women, marginalized groups, and key populations, including LGBTI, People Living with HIV (PLHIV), and Persons with Disabilities (PwDs) (iii) Parliament and key institutions strengthened to perform core functions for improved accountability, participation and representation. The main target group/beneficiaries for UN One Programme II are the Members of Parliament, Parliament Secretariat staff, professional staff of the OAG, Judiciary, Bhutan National Legal Institute and the JSW Law, National Commission for Women and Children, Royal Bhutan Police and CSOs like RENEW and Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan.

The outputs are: evidence-based data generated to mainstream SDG 16 into national development processes. In 2017 the national survey on prevalence rate of violence against women will be measured against the baseline of 29%¹, benefitting government in understating the trends of gender based violence in Bhutan. The survey will cover almost 49% women population of the total population which is 0.78 million². Following the Vulnerability Baseline Assessment in 2014, 14 vulnerable groups has been identified which will be further analysed in 2017 to understand in-depth on the vulnerable groups. This will benefit Government, CSOs and Development Partners to develop strategic interventions; policies developed and legal frameworks reviewed to help protect the rights of women, marginalized groups and key population. Following the needs assessment on disabilities, the national disability policy will be formulated. Ten members of the High Level Inter-Agency Task Force on disability including members of Parliament will be supported for a UNCRPD sensitization exchange visit. These activities will be benefiting about 26,520, representing 3.4% of the Bhutan's total population living with a disability³. Following a request from the Parliament to understand LGBT issues better and possibility of discussion

¹ Eleventh Five Year Plan - Programme Profile - Volume II, page 435

² Population and Housing Census of Bhutan (PHCB) conducted in 2005

³ Population and Housing Census of Bhutan (PHCB) conducted in 2005

of section 213 of Penal Code criminalizing Sodomy in the winter Parliament session, two members of parliament will be supported to attend the Salzburg LGBT Forum, 2016, benefitting estimated 3000 Men who Have Sex with Men (MSM) and Transgender (TG) population; strengthened justice sector strategic planning and coordination. Train about 150 lawyers, judges, law enforcement professionals to administer justice for vulnerable groups; an effective legal aid system institutionalized, in line with international standards. Bar Council/Association established and provide continued capacity development support to the Bar Association/Bar Council to develop effective legal aid system; increased access to justice, legal awareness training, and support services to women, marginalized groups, and key populations. In phase II 4 additional service centers (shelter, community support, health) will be established in 4 Dzongkhags, benefitting more than 5000 women. Legal awareness raising programme with BNLI will continue and the TV series on important legislations aired on BBS will continue to cover a large audience (as per the Media Impact Study 2008, BBS is the most watched TV station in Bhutan); enhanced representation and outreach capacities of the Parliament; Strengthen legislative and research capacity of parliament committees (select 2 to 3 committees - Women, Children and Youth Committee, Human Rights Committee & Legislative Committee) and train 35 assistant research officers and 23 committee secretaries on legislation and policy issues, South-South Cooperation for parliamentarians will be organized, in phase II, 47 videoconferencing facility will be installed covering 47 geogs in 20 Dzongkhags, benefitting about 12% of the population; improved enabling environment for gender equality and women's empowerment. In phase II, continued support will be provided to initiatives contributing to the creation of a conducive environment to increase opportunities for women to participate in political life at all levels of decision-making through the implementation of the National Action Plan for Gender Equality, including developing the Gender Equality Policy. In 2016, six month maternity leave introduced benefiting 33% of female civil servants⁴, reviewed 33 national policies from gender perspective and reviewed legislations and policies from the perspective of gender equality in elected offices of total population of Bhutan; Improved gender-sensitivity of the Parliament and local governments, parliament women representation is 8.3 %, the target in phase II is 20% (at least 14 female members in parliament), institutionalize Gender Responsive planning and Budgeting in 3 ministries of health, Agriculture and Forest and Education, in the phase II the GRBP will be expanded to ministry of labour and human resources, trained 50 planning officers on GRBP in phase I as Training of trainers.

The UN One phase II has been closely coordinated with the Legal Sector Programme II (LSP II). While the UN One Phase II will focus on inclusive decision-making and policy development in the legal sector, strengthening legal institutions and parliament to perform core functions for improved accountability, participation and representation, the LSP II will focus on the operational part of the judiciary on the providing training to the judges and bench clerks on judgment drafting, contracts, handling of family/child cases and building modern infrastructure.

⁴ Annual Report 2015, Royal Civil Service Commission

COVERING NOTE:

1. Project overview

Since the 1970s, Bhutan has been inspired by His Majesty the 4th King's vision of Gross National Happiness (GNH) as a superior measure by which to judge national progress, a vision that has translated into concrete governance agendas and policy planning tools, and has given rise to a set of robust metrics designed to measure Bhutan's development progress.

Bhutan's experience has inspired policy makers and policy frameworks around the world, including Agenda 2030 with its 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), signed in September 2015 by 193 world leaders. As one of the signatories to the SDGs, and as the nation commences the development of its 12th Five Year Plan (FYP) for 2018-2023, the Royal Government of Bhutan (RGoB) is set to identify areas of convergence between GNH and SDGs, such that the new national development framework ably reports results against both in line with nationally determined priorities.

Just like GNH, the SDGs conceptualize "sustainable development" in terms much broader than a mere focus on gross national economic output. Both frameworks recognized the role of inclusive, democratic governance, with responsive institutions, and access to justice for all as paramount. Both frameworks focus on the importance of reducing vulnerabilities, a key objective in Bhutan's current, 11th FYP. The inherent opportunity this presents for Bhutan to further deepen its democratic progress is clear -- achieving local and national results, showcasing global good practices, including at the High Level Political Forum (HLPF) in New York, and following up on the agreed recommendations of the Universal Periodic Review (UPR).

This project, therefore, captures UNDP's support to the RGoB in achieving this task, with a particular focus on the Good Governance pillar of GNH, and how to consider SDG 16 on peace and justice, SDG 10 on inequality, and SDG five on gender within that pillar, to advance one, harmonious, GNH-focused way to measure democratic governance results in Bhutan.

According to the 2015 GNH Survey, people's perception of good governance has significantly decreased for three out of four indicators, compared to the 2010 Survey: government performance (46 points); fundamental rights (11 points); and political participation (9 points), with the exception of basic services (which witnessed a 20 points increase). Although people's perception of government performance might be partially attributable to rising expectations of democracy, low score on political participation and fundamental rights warrant close attention. This is echoed by results from the Democracy Index 2015 where one observes consistently low scores on political participation (2.78) and civil liberties (3.82).

Therefore, while impressive progress has been achieved in the area of governance in Bhutan to consolidate democracy, including with the support of Austria through the UN One Programme, widening the democratic space for the active participation of people in decision-making, and enhancing the quality and accessibility of the services they receive, will be critical.

A number of issues warrant further review:

- The absence of an overarching justice-sector strategy makes progress challenging;

- There are gaps in the legal framework to fully protect the rights of women, and of marginalized, vulnerable groups, including key populations;
- There is a lack of data and adequate systems to measure the effectiveness and inclusiveness of governance interventions;
- Regulation of the growing legal profession and the establishment of a legal aid system warrant review;
- The Parliament has called for capacity strengthening support to perform its core functions of legislation, oversight and representation;
- Civil society are calling for the expansion of democratic space and greater recognition of and support for their role in society;
- Institutional and socio-cultural barriers to women's political participation persist.

Therefore, building on the progress to date cited in more detail below, this Phase II of the UN One Programme's governance work will collaborate with partners from the following:

- Royal Government of Bhutan (RGoB)- Gross National Happiness Commission (GNHC), Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA), Ministry of Finance (MoF), National Commission for Women and Children (NCWC), Ministry of Information and Communication (MoIC), Ministry of Health (MoH), IGNHaS/Royal University of Bhutan.
- 2. The justice sector- Office of Attorney General (OAG), Bhutan National Legal Institute (BNLI), Courts, Royal Bhutan Police (RBP), and Jigme Singye Wangchuck School of Law (JSWSoL).
- 3. Parliamentarians
- 4. Civil society, and vulnerable groups- Bhutan Broad Casting Service (BBS), Respect Educate Nurture Empower Women (RENEW), Bhutan Centre for Media and Democracy (BCMD), Disabled People's Association of Bhutan (DPAB), Ability Bhutan Society (ABS), Draktsho, Lhak-Sam, LGBT community, etc.

The main target group for UN One Programme II are the Members of Parliament, Parliament Secretariat staff, professional staff of the OAG, Judiciary, the Bhutan National Legal Institute and the JSW Law, National Commission for Women and Children, Royal Bhutan Police and CSOs like RENEW and Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan.

The secondary target groups are beneficiaries of the project partners such as women, marginalized groups and key population. This project will strengthen the capacity of civil society organizations working with victims of domestic's violence, people living with HIV, PwDs and LGBT. In addition to disability policy formulation, the phase II this project will support the Multi-Sectoral Task Force towards ratification of UNCPRD through south-south cooperation and UN joint initiative on disability. To strengthened justice sector strategic planning and coordination, about 150 lawyers, judges, law enforcement professionals will be targeted to train on administration of justice for vulnerable groups. Additional service centers (shelter, community support, health) will be established in 4 Dzongkhags, benefitting more than 5000 women. Legal awareness raising programme through BBS programmes on important legislations will be aired covering 20 dzongkhags (as per the Media Impact Study 2008, BBS is the most watched TV station in Bhutan). In the phase II, the project will target 2 to 3 parliament committees to enhance their legislative capacity, train 35 assistant research officers and 23 committee

secretaries on research, analysis and preparation of policy briefs for Members. Women representation in parliament will be targeted at 20%. (at least 14 female members in parliament).

Phase II has enhanced its partnerships fitting to work towards the following three outcomes. There are six linked outputs, six outcome indicators, eighteen output indicators, related targets and means of verification (details available under the Results Framework). The indicators and targets are from the UN One Programme Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. The framework has been reviewed during the Mid-Term Review and has been revised. The Results Framework proposed in this Phase has taken on board the revisions from the Mid-Term Review. The work on indicators for Outcome 3 and 4 under UN One Programme is a work in progress and recently a workshop on "Justice Sector and SDG 16" was conducted, which will result in development of a "White paper"- part of which will include a comprehensive Results Framework for the "Justice sector". Therefore, indicators in the UN One Programme and the Results Framework under this project will be updated accordingly:

- **Outcome 1:** Evidence-based, inclusive decision-making and policy development is advanced, towards a single policy framework on governance that measures both GNH and SDG results, where no-one is left behind.
- **Outcome 2:** The Rule of Law and related institutions are strengthened for enhanced access to justice for women, marginalized groups, and key populations, including LGBTI, People Living with HIV (PLHIV), and Persons with Disabilities (PwDs).
- **Outcome 3:** Parliament and key institutions strengthened to perform core functions for improved accountability, participation and representation

2. Project Duration

The duration of the ADC support to UN One Programme Phase II will be from 1st October 2016 to 31st December of 2018. The multi-year work plan in section 6 provides detailed activities with implementation schedule.

3. Project Cost

The total project budget including the management cost is *EUR 600,000* for duration of 2 years.

Sub- Total for Project Activities	565,202
Project Manager (NOA level)	30,078
Project Management Support Costs	31,504
General Management Services (8%)	45,216
Sub-Total for Project Management	106,798
Grand TOTAL (in USD)	672,000
Grand TOTAL (in Euro)	600,000

COVERING NOTE FOR AUSTRIAN DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION UNDP BHUTAN, JULY 2016

4. The national and international context

4.1 Bhutan's 11th Five Year Plan (11th FYP) and national priorities

The UN One Programme is aligned with the 11th FYP (UNDAF: Bhutan UN One Programme 2014-2018, page 16) and so is this project grounded in the national priorities of the Royal Government of Bhutan, as articulated in the 11th FYP and through key national addresses and documentation. Specifically, this project contributes to all six national key result areas:

- Democracy and Governance strengthened.
- Gender friendly environment for women's participation.
- Safe Society.
- Needs of Vulnerable Group addressed.
- Improved public service delivery.
- Corruption reduced.

"The Promotion of Good Governance" is the fourth pillar of GNH, providing "an enabling environment that is vital for sustainable and equitable socio-economic development." Two of the National Key Result Areas (NKRAs) therein are that "democracy and governance are strengthened" and "the needs of vulnerable groups addressed." Within this, at the sectoral level, "strengthened accountability, transparency, efficiency and effectiveness in governance," and "enhanced efficiency and effectiveness of public service delivery" are identified as a key result areas (KRAs). Supporting progress against these national and sectoral key result areas is therefore the focus of this project: working with Bhutan on governance and justice to leave no-one behind and deliver better services through stronger governance and justice institutions.

One of the challenges – intimated in the 11th Plan as a risk for justice sector institutions in meeting their objectives -- is that the sector lacks an overarching strategy. For example, in the 11th Plan, the Office of the Attorney General's objective is stated as ensuring a transparent, efficient, accountable prosecution system in the country to uphold the rule of law and make Bhutan 'corruption free'. To date, the OAG has focused on establishing the infrastructure necessary to function while continuing to deliver services in line with its capacity. To deliver on its 11th Plan commitments, however, including strengthening the prosecution system and standardizing and enhancing the standard of the drafting of laws, the OAG needs support in developing its technical and strategic planning capacities, and in mitigating the potential non-compliance of other related entities and institutions as they endeavour to implement that strategy. Hence this project will support enhanced collaboration and cooperation between justice sector entities, including on critical issues that require a collaborative approach such as implementing the Jambi Act.

Enhancing the standards of living and quality of life of the most vulnerable sections of society – one of the objectives of the 11th Plan and an NKRA under the Governance pillar - requires first understanding who is vulnerable and why. The Plan looks to establish baselines and targets for emerging issues around the "small but growing" number of vulnerable people, working closely with civil society partners. Through the UN's One Programme, with Austria's support, a vulnerability baseline has now been established. The next task in line with the objectives of the 11th Plan -- which for example specifically recognizes the importance of focusing on groups such as people living with disabilities, elderly people, single parents, drayang girls, and women, youth, and children -- is to delve deeper into certain areas for

greater understanding, such that targeted interventions can be developed to reduce their vulnerabilities.

In 2015, His Majesty issued a Command to review any conflict in the existing laws with the Constitution, following which a Task Force has been formed including members from the Judiciary, the Office of the Attorney General, the Cabinet Secretariat, Bhutan National Legal Institute, the Royal Bhutan Police, the Parliament, and a private law firm. The Task Force first findings, as reported in the 2015 State of the Nation, report that out of the 126 Acts, 14 conflict with the Constitution and other Acts, and require consolidation/harmonization, 14 should be repealed, two are redundant and should be repealed and three have not been implemented. Recognizing that the policy and legislative enabling environment is also critical to reduce vulnerabilities and ensure access to justice for vulnerable groups, the project will support this ongoing work to review Bhutan's policy and legislative framework.

Further, the project will help ensure a "gender-friendly environment for women's participation" as articulated in the 11th Plan as an NKRA, which cites the importance of women's participation in elected office and mainstreaming gender-responsive policies and strategies into an increasing number of agencies as key performance indicators (KPIs).

4.2 Sustainable Development Goals

Lead Goal and Targets for this concept: SDG 16 (16.3, 16.5, 16.6, 16.7, 16.10, 16.12) Supporting Goal and Targets for this concept: SDG 5 (5.5, 5.6, 5.a, 5.c), SDG 10 (10.3), SDG 17 (17.18, 17.19)

Agenda 2030, comprising 17 Goals, 169 targets, and 231 indicators⁵, is the first international development framework to include a specific 'governance' goal: Goal 16 focuses on **Peace and Justice**, aiming to **"promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels".** Given the centrality of inclusive governance to achieving sustainable development in all countries, including Bhutan, and as the country is on the cusp of drafting its next FYP – the 12th Plan, achieving SDG 16 would be both an end in itself and a means to deliver progress against all the other SDGs, ensuring that "no one is left behind".

In this regard, the implementation and monitoring of the SDGs, starting with SDG 16, presents an immediate development challenge for the RoGB. In particular, it will require quality, accessible, timely and reliable disaggregated data to measure progress against targets and indicators and enhanced statistical capacities for evidence-based decision-making. This is in line with the requirements of SDG targets 17.18 on data and 17.19 on means of measuring sustainable development progress, as well as the articulated objectives of Bhutan's National Statistical Bureau under the 11th Five Year Plan.

SDG implementation will require also a conducive policy environment with a legal framework protecting the fundamental rights of the people of Bhutan, in line with international standards, and addressing the special needs of women, marginalized groups and key population. As noted above, this focus is also embedded in Bhutan's 11th Plan with the NKRA on "needs of vulnerable groups addressed."

⁵ The number and nature of indicators is subject to change.

Therefore by implementing some or all of the recommendations of the 2015 Vulnerability Baseline assessment, through this Phase II of Austria's support to the One Programme, Bhutan would make progress not only against SDG 16, but also SDG 10 on inequality, particularly target 10.3: *"Ensure equal opportunity and reduce inequalities of outcome, including by eliminating discriminatory laws, policies and practices and promoting appropriate legislation, policies and action in this regard,"* and SDG 5 on *"achieving gender equality and empowerment of all women and girls",* particularly targets 5.5 on women's political participation, 5.6 on universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights, utilising particularly the two means of implementations- 5.a women's economic empowerment and 5.c effective policies and legislation.

4.3 The UN One Programme, UNDP's Strategic Plan and Legal Sector Plan (LSP) 2014-2018

UNDP's support fits into the framework of the UN One Programme 2014-2018 and its Outcome 4 (UNDAF: UN One Programme 2014-2018, page no. 28-31), which focuses on sustainable development: "By 2018, governance institutions and communities exercise the principles of democratic governance at the national and local levels with a focus on inclusiveness, transparency, accountability and evidence-based decision making". In particular, the project contributes to Outputs 4.1; 4.3; 4.4; and 4.5. The project also contributes to Outcome 3 of the UN One programme on Gender Equality and Child Protection with particular focus to Outputs 3.1; 3.2; and 3.3 (UNDAF: UN One Programme 2014-2018, page no. 25-28).

The project is also grounded in the UNDP Strategic Plan 2014–17⁶, with a particular focus on the following Outcomes:

- **Outcome 2:** Citizen expectations for voice, development, the rule of law and accountability are met by stronger systems of democratic governance
- **Outcome 3:** Countries have strengthened institutions to progressively deliver universal access to basic services
- **Outcome 4:** Faster progress is achieved in reducing gender inequality and promoting women's empowerment
- **Outcome 7:** Development debates and actions at all levels prioritise poverty, inequality and exclusion, consistent with our engagement principles

The project also has greater complementarities with the LSP and as the justice sector moves into developing a comprehensive justice sector strategy, synergies between the two projects will be evident.

⁶ http://www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/corporate/UNDP_strategic-plan_14-17_v9_web.pdf

5. Project outcomes

Figure 1: Summary of UN One Programme linkages to 11 FYP

UN One Phase I	UN One Phase II	11 FYP
Or One Phase I Outcome 4: Access to Justice - Vulnerability Baseline Assessment (VBA) - South-south exchange in Cambodia & training on disability for Task Force Need assessment or Persons with Disabilities Treaty ratification guidelines Bar Association (BA)/Council	 Outcome 4: Access to Justice In depth analysis of priority group based on VBA report. Comprehensive review of the 11 FYP governance policy framework. Research on 10 years of Democracy. Development of Ntaional Policy on PwD. Support towards ratification & implementation of UNCRPD. 	Contributes to all 6 Nationa Key Result Areas) of Governnace pillar: - Democracy & Governance stregnthened. - Gender friendly environment for women's participation. - Safe Society - Needs of Vulnerable Group
Legal Aid Symposium Legal Aid feasibility study Assessment of BNLI training materials. Legal awareness on BBS, continued through Phase II Outcome 3: GEWE Gender Responsive Planning Budgetting	 Development of Justice sector strategy. Establishment of BA/Council. Capacity building on Legal Aid. Training JUdges on the Laws Virtual Zomdue (Video conferencing) plat form. Strengthening capacity of Parliamentary committees Outcome 3: GEWE Training on GRPB for MoLHR (UNW).	addressed. - Improved Public Service Deivery - Corruption reduced.
(GRPB) - Multi-satleholder consultation workshop on GBV Prevention & development of SoP case management (with UNICEF) - Media guideline for reporting on gender issues - RBP- Friends of Police (community police) - REfurbished & furnished two Safe homes. - Legal support service training.	 SoP for Safe Homes & expand safe homes for victims of DV. RBP- review of police training curriculum, WCPU, FoP. Establish legal support services for RENEW. Conduct VAW study. Gender indicator handbook. Development of Gender Equality Policy. 	

<u>Project Outcome 1:</u> Evidence-based, inclusive decision-making and policy development is advance, towards a single policy framework on governance that measures both GNH and SDG results, where no-one is left behind.

This project outcome contributes specifically to **Output 4.1. of the UN One Programme 2014-2018**: "Key national and local institutions strengthen systems for effective public finance management and integrated monitoring of plans and programmes, evidence-based decision making based on harmonized national statistics and information".

Output 1.1. Evidence-based data generated to mainstream SDG 16 into national development processes

The UN One programme identifies the lack of harmonization of statistics as "one of the biggest obstacles preventing the strengthening of evidence-based decision making in Bhutan. This includes: collection, compilation, analysis and use of disaggregated data and information for decision making and informing the design and implementation of policies, plans and programmes". Overall, there is a paucity of studies, baseline data and surveys to clearly ascertain the situation and no adequate systems to measure the effectiveness and inclusiveness of governance interventions, and recommend appropriate corrective measures. In particular, the 11th FYP acknowledges the existence of data gaps with regard to emerging

social challenges, including the absence of a centralized agency within the government responsible for catering to the needs of the growing number of vulnerable groups.

- ✓ During Phase I, in line with the 11th FYP a "Vulnerability Baseline Assessment" was carried out. In Phase II, building on the Vulnerability Baseline Assessment, further studies will be undertaken to strengthen the evidence-base for ensuring that governance interventions fully contribute to the human development of women, marginalized groups (LGBT, PwDs, PLHIV) and key population, and support the implementation of related recommendations.
- In Phase II, comprehensive review of the 11th FYP governance policy framework will also be \checkmark conducted and multi-stakeholders consultations organized to mainstream SDG 16 in the strategic planning process and inform the development of an evidence-based governance indicator system for the 12th Plan. Governance statistical systems will be strengthened across sectors to provide better evidence on trends, supplemented by surveys of people's experiences and perceptions of governance institutions and services delivery. A nationwide analysis of the prevalence of Violence Against Women and Girls (prevalence of VAW is 29%, 2012) will be conducted in collaboration with National Commission for Women and Children covering almost 50% of the population which constitutes women. A gender indicator handbook will be developed to guide all agencies in gender mainstreaming, advocacy and incorporation of women empowerment in mainstream education curricula, and to help measure progress in national implementation and compliance to the CEDAW, the Beijing Platform for Action and other gender-related international instruments. Comprehensive research will be carried out to capture progress 10 years on from the country's transition into a democratic constitutional monarchy in 2008 in the form of a National Human Development Report (NHDR) to be published in 2018.

Output 1.2. Policies developed and legal frameworks reviewed to help protect the rights of women, marginalized groups and key populations

Although Bhutan has established a comprehensive legal framework and the pace of reforms accelerated with the development of a considerable body of legislation since 2000, culminating in the Constitution of 2008, which guaranties the fundamental rights of its people, the country still has gaps in its legal framework to be able to fully protect the rights of women, marginalized groups and key population, in line with international standards. As an illustration, Bhutan does not have a comprehensive Gender Equality Policy. Bhutan has signed, but not ratified the UN Convention of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD).

✓ During Phase I, in line with the 11th FYP, a Vulnerability Baseline Assessment was conducted and in the process of being finalised. One of the vulnerable groups identified in the report is Person with disabilities comprising 3.4%⁷ of the Bhutan's population. As a result of the VBA report, government of Bhutan has formed a Multi-sectoral Task Force to formulate the National Disability Policy. A five-day workshop was conducted in the country with International experts hired by UNDP to train the task force on disability. Following that the Task Force attended the mid-term review of the Cambodian National Disability Strategic Plan in Cambodia. As a result of this, the task force developed a Concept Note for formulation of National Disability Policy and submitted to the Cabinet for endorsement. Given that the available data (3.4 %) is 10 years old and the multi-sectoral task force recommended the National Statistical Bureau (NSB) to include Washington Group disability questions in the 2016 Census. The NSB did not take the

⁷ National Statistical Bureau, Population and Housing Census of Bhutan, 2005.

recommendation on board citing that the scope of the census will not be able to cover in depth on a particular issue. The recommendation from NSB was to carry out a disability census. Another major achievement was development of Treaty Ratification Guidelines and submission to the Cabinet.

✓ In Phase II, following the endorsement of the Concept Note, continued support will be provided for formulation of the policy. The government initiated a needs assessment of PwDs (26,520, Population and Housing Census of Bhutan 2005) to inform the policy and parts of the assessment has been supported by this project. This project will implement follow up of the Vulnerability Baseline Assessment Report in partnership with the government and other stakeholders. The Treaty Ratification Guidelines has been endorsed in February 2016 and dissemination of the guidelines to various government agencies has been initiated. Following the endorsement of the guidelines, a High Level Task Force (24 Members) on disability (led by Ministry of Foreign Affairs) has also been formed to work on the ratification of UNCRPD. This project will continue to support government and the various task forces to formulate disability policy and gear towards ratification of the UNCRPD including capacity building and exchange programs.

<u>Project Outcome 2:</u> The Rule of Law and related institutions are strengthened for enhanced access to justice for women, marginalized groups, and key populations, including LGBTI, People Living with HIV (PLHIV), and Persons with Disabilities (PwDs).

The project outcome contributes specifically to Output **4.3 of the UN One Programme 2014-2018**: "Women and youth have increased opportunities to participate in leadership as well as in policy making, planning, and implementation of development plans" **and Output 4.4.**: "Media and CSOs are better able to promote the participation of people in particular youth, in democratic processes, public dialogue and discourse," and **Output 4.5. of the UN One Programme 2014-2018**: "People have greater awareness of their rights and duties and increased access to formal and informal justice redress mechanisms". It also contributes to **Outcome 3**; **Output 3.1**.: "Strengthened legal and policy environment to advance the rights and protection of women and children", **Output 3.2**.: "Gender mainstreaming in key ministries, autonomous bodies, non-governmental organizations with resourced gender mainstreaming strategies" and **Output 3.3**.: "Boys, men, girls, and women have increased awareness of and positive attitudes towards preventing and eliminating gender-based violence".

Output 2.1. Strengthened justice sector strategic planning and coordination

There is no Ministry of Justice in Bhutan. Current efforts that are being undertaken are not coordinated and based on the initiative of various actors who acting individually are constrained by lack of technical and financial resources. The absence of a central agency that is responsible for coordinating efforts poses a major challenge to effectively address the social emerging challenges.

- ✓ During Phase I, discussions for need of a comprehensive Justice strategy was initiated and a consultation workshop co-hosted by the GNHC, Office of Attorney General and the UNDP is planned. The two key objectives of the workshop are:
 - 1. Towards a justice sector indicator system for the 12th Plan.
 - 2. Towards a justice sector strategy for the 12th Plan.

✓ While this workshop is not funded through this project, one major outcome of the workshop, which is development of a justice strategy commencing with drafting a White Paper for the Justice Sector, is planned for support from the project in Phase II. At the same time, the project will support the Office of the Attorney General in developing a Strategic Plan for the first time benefitting approximately 30 staff, in line with the overarching Justice Sector strategy. The landmark in the justice sector will be the development of justice sector strategy which will benefit Judiciary (53 judges), the Office of Attorney General (15 Attorneys), Bhutan National Legal Institute, JSW Law School.

Output 2.2. An ethical, competent and autonomous legal profession developed

Although the Jabmi Act 2003 foresees the establishment of a Bar Association (*Jabmi Thuentshog*) and a Bar Council (*Jabmi Tshodey*), neither of these bodies has yet been established and there is currently no clear role of attorneys licensed to practice nor legal framework governing who has the right of audience in courts. There is no formal system to license practitioners and no complaints mechanism to uphold professional standards and discipline those who fall short of them.

- ✓ During Phase I, an Interim Secretariat Committee to process the formation of Bhutan's Bar Council and Bar Association was set up by the Attorney General in January 2015. The plans for the development of rules and regulations for the Bar Association and Council have been delayed as the Jabmi Act (2003) Amendment Bill was discussed in the National Council winter session of 2015 and deferred to 2016 parliament summer session.
- ✓ With the Jabmi (Amendment) Act passed during this summer session, in Phase II, establishment of Bar Association/Bar Council will be continued, including drafting of the rules and regulations, as well building capacity as it undertakes its core functions, including: producing a code of conduct and legal material for lawyers and other legal services providers; establishing a mechanism for admission to legal practice (bar examination); complaints mechanism, supervision and discipline; continuing legal education; pro bono and legal aid. Partnership with the newly established Jigme Singye Wangchuck School of Law will be explored in developing a clinical legal education (CLE) programmes.

Output 2.3. An effective legal aid system institutionalized, in line with international standards

Although the Civil and Criminal Procedure Code of Bhutan 2001 states that "an indigent accused shall have legal aid provided for one's defence when the interest of justice so requires" and the Jabmi Act mandates the Bar Council to "organize legal aid to an indigent person (Pro Bono) in the prescribed manner", neither of these provisions has been formally implemented yet and there is currently no mechanism for legal aid oversight in Bhutan. Some free legal advice and assistance is provided by NGOs and the National Commission for Women and Children (NCWC).

✓ During Phase I, following the Legal Aid Symposium, a "Working Group" was set up by the Attorney General, composed of representatives from eight Government and civil society agencies. In preparation for the Legal Aid Symposium, three participants from Bhutan (The Director of and a Judge from BNLI, and the Registrar General of the Supreme Court) were sponsored to take part in the 3rd Annual Asia Pro Bono Conference5, which took place in Singapore. In addition to the better understanding on issues related to legal aid, it enabled BNLI in particular to better coordinate with OAG and UNDP to organize the symposium. The working

group also visited Singapore and Thailand to understand international best practices. Following this a stakeholder consultative meeting was facilitated by the UNDP and the working group. Based on stakeholder consultative meeting and the knowledge gained from the exchange visit, the working group developed a proposal with "recommendation of Models viable in Bhutan and the need for a specific legislation relating to legal aid" and submitted to the Cabinet. Pending the Jabmi (Amendment) bill, no decision was taken on the proposal.

✓ In Phase II, with the Jabmi (Amendment) bill passed, and awaiting endorsement of the proposal, continued support will be provided towards the institutionalization of a legal aid system as per recommendations of the proposal, in line with the UN Principles and Guidelines on Access to Legal Aid as well as to the development of required capacities for its implementation. In line with support to development of capacities, it will fund participation of Bhutanese delegates to the International Conference on legal Aid (Argentina, November, 2016).

Output 2.4. Increased access to justice, legal awareness training, and support services to women, marginalized groups, and key populations.

- \checkmark During Phase I, an assessment was conducted of the BNLI's current practices and programmes: reviewing BNLI existing training materials and methods; working with the BNLI to increase the capacity of its educators through the application of best teaching methods and other pedagogy practices; and providing recommendations for future programming to the BNLI in terms of approaches, methods and overall strategy. Through ADC's financial support and UNDP's technical assistance, BNLI developed a TV series on legal awareness raising program. The program has huge bearing on empowerment of the people residing in remote parts of the country and who generally are unable to update on any legal development and new legislations in the country. This programme is an example of good partnership, involving the media to disseminate legal information, where Bhutan Broadcasting Service also joined the BNLI team to conduct the legal dissemination programme. The programme covered five Dzongkhags namely Thimphu (Gagala), Paro (Doteng), Chhukha (Bjagchog), Punakha (Dzomi) and Wangduephodrang (Thedtsho) and a total of 100 participants- 20 each from the five dzongkhags attended the programme. During the program important legislation like The Marriage Act, 1980; The Inheritance Act, 1980; The Land Act, 2007; The Movable and Immovable Property Act, 1999; The Civil and Criminal Procedure Code, 2001; The Penal Code, 2004; The Child Care and Protection Act, 2011; The Child Adoption Act, 2012; The Domestic Violence Prevention Act, 2013; and The Tobacco Control Act, 2014 were disseminated. The program was conducted in December 2015.
- ✓ In Phase II, based on BNLI reporting that similar programs have been requested from other rural areas to understand these new laws, scaling up of this programme is recommended and in line with BNLI 11th Plan objectives. Further, training approximately 150 Judges, lawyers and law enforcement officers to enhance their capacity and role in the implementation of legislation will be pursued, in line with the Judiciary's 11th Plan needs assessment, where the professional development of court staff is prioritized. Further partnering with RENEW to promote legal education and support services among women, marginalized groups and key population emphasizing their rights and the remedies available to them will be pursued. The legal support services in RENEW will be supported benefiting more than 5000 women who visit RENEW for protection, counselling and legal services. Comprehensive support mechanisms will be in place, including rules and regulations and Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) to support survivors of gender-based violence; additional women- and child-friendly safe homes will be supported with

training on the Domestic Violence Prevention Act, and an enhanced, safer working environment. Regional networking and exchanges will also be encouraged with CLE programmes in South and South-East Asia.

<u>Project Outcome 3:</u> Parliament and key institutions strengthened to perform core functions for improved accountability, participation and representation

The project outcome contributes specifically to **Output 4.3 of the UN One Programme 2014-2018**: "Women and youth have increased opportunities to participate in leadership as well as in policy making, planning, and implementation of development plans" **and Output 4.4. of the UN One Programme 2014-2018**: "Media and CSOs are better able to promote the participation of people in particular youth, in democratic processes, public dialogue and discourse".

Output 3.1. Enhanced legislative, representation and outreach capacities of the Parliament

Effective functioning of the Parliament is central to the success and maturity of democracy in Bhutan. Bhutan's democratic Parliament is only eight years old. The current Parliament is the second one. Almost 70 percent of the current members of Parliament (MPs) are newly elected with very limited experience and skills on legislative, oversight and constituency management. The culture of members of MPs initiating legislation is absent in Bhutan. So far, line ministries drafted all the bills tabled for deliberations in the Parliament. In addition, research support capacity at both houses is limited, hampering parliamentarian's ability to analyse, propose and/or have critical review of draft legislations. The National Assembly's current oversight role is largely confined to overseeing the government's public expenditures and there are no mechanisms for monitoring the parliamentary oversight committee's reports and actionable recommendations to the Prime Minister and the Cabinet. Public hearings are not utilized to their fully potential.

- ✓ During Phase I, UNDP support for Parliamentary development has been through other funding. However, given that the partnership has worked very well as demonstrated by the "Virtual Zomdu" project's role in connecting parliaments and their constituencies, and given the critical role of Parliament in advancing access to justice and the rule of law in Bhutan, including through legislative analysis and review (including considering the impact of legislation on vulnerable groups), treaty ratification preparation (including looking towards ratification of the Convention for People with Disabilities), and as leaders in deepening Bhutan's democratic culture through community/constituency outreach on critical issues (through Virtual Zomdu), it would be fitting for Phase II to encompass Parliamentary support. UNDP has been requested by Parliament to develop a mid-to-long term project to support implementation of the Parliament's Five Year Strategy. Project development is underway with the intent that both Parliament and UNDP will work together to mobilize resources from interested partners for its implementation.
- ✓ In Phase II, therefore, Parliament will be supported through: strengthening parliamentary engagement with their constituencies including through enhanced public hearings, through the Virtual Zomdu platform; strengthening parliamentary committees for more effective legislative analysis and review, as well as oversight and accountability, and investing in Parliamentarian's leadership and skills development. Also priority will be given to addressing parliamentary committees immediate capacity needs to ensure structures and procedures are fit for purpose for delivering on the SDGs and towards meeting best practice international parliamentary standard, in line with the recommendations from the UNDP Parliament Committee System Development Report

from October 2015⁸. In this regard, a comprehensive functional review of the committee system rules against best practice will be carried out, and 2 to 3 committees comprising of 18 Members identified for targeted and tailored technical support, prioritizing the public accounts committee and others based on the potential impact of their improved functioning, including the development of annual work plans and mechanisms for effective monitoring and follow-up, as per the recommendations of Transparency International's Assessment of the Bhutan Anti-Corruption Commission 2015⁹.

Output 3.2. Improved enabling environment for gender equality and women's empowerment.

In spite a strong government commitment to gender equality and women empowerment reflected in the Constitution, Bhutan's ratification of the Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in 1981, the five consecutive FYPs as well as the formulation of a National Plan of Action for Gender (2008-2013), effective implementation on the ground has been a challenge. In addition to the absence of a comprehensive National Gender Equality Policy and political factors constraining the full implementation of the National Plan of Action to Promote Gender Equality in Elected Offices (such as the introduction of a quota system), there is a lack of adequate institutional structures and resources to implement existing laws and policies. Gender stereotypes about women's capabilities for political leadership also exist among men, while lack of education, functional literacy skills, low self-esteem and triple burden that women bear as housewives, mothers and incomegenerators have been identified as some of the factors explaining women's low political participation.

The causal analysis reveals that the development challenge has its root cause in the lack of a long democratic culture in Bhutan, therefore adopting a human rights based approach is at the core of addressing this challenge, and the selected approach for the project.

- ✓ During Phase I, support on Gender Responsive Planning Budgeting (GRPB) has been from this project and UN women, in close partnership with the Department of National Budget (DNB), Ministry of Finance. The main achievement was mainstreaming of GRPB in the Budget Preparation Guidelines of the Budget Call Notification of the Ministry of Finance, Royal Government in three Ministries of Agriculture and Forests, Education, and Health. Prior to 2015, the RAA was not involved in the GRPB process, and auditing from gender perspective was not conducted in Bhutan. With support from this project, sensitization training on gender, GRPB, and auditing from gender perspective was held with South-South support from the Office of Comptroller and Auditor General of India. Following the workshop, RAA developed a training module on auditing from gender perspective and conducted a Training of Trainers (ToTs) among its top managers.
- ✓ In Phase II, considering the increased capacity development needs partly as a result of the developments above, and following discussions with DNB, it has been agreed to support GRPB mainstreaming trainings in Ministry of Labour and Human Resources. Furthermore, in Phase II, the RAA plans to conduct thematic auditing which is gender sensitive in the Ministries of Agriculture and Forest, Health and Education, where Gender Responsive Planning and Budgeting is already initiated.

⁸ John Hyde, UNDP Parliament Committee System Development Report, 2015.

⁹ Transparency International, Anti-corruption Agency Strengthening Initiative Assessment of the Bhutan Anti-Corruption Commission, 2015, p.47-48.

- ✓ During phase I, in terms of Gender Based Violence, the biggest achievement has been development of Standard Operating Procedures (SoPs) for the "Referral and Management of cases related to Children and Women in Difficult circumstances" in partnership with UNICEF. Another major achievement was development of guidelines which strengthened the role of media to enhance awareness on issues related to the rights of women and children, as well as to report on individual cases in a responsible way and to minimize consequences to the parties concerned, especially victims/survivors of violence and discrimination. As part of prevention of GBV, a workshop on Gender-based violence Prevention was conducted in 2015. As a result of the workshop, a concept note for a joint programme on the implementation of the DVPA and the Common Country Programme Action Plan (CCPA) was developed.
- ✓ Intensive efforts were pursued with RENEW and multiple stakeholders to raise awareness of the role of men in the family, sensitization on domestic and gender-based violence and sexual reproductive health and rights, and to support alternative livelihoods and shelter homes for survivors. UNDP supported the creation of police public partnership by engaging community based role model known as "Friends of Police" (FoP). In 2015, further strengthened the institutional partnership between NCWC and Royal Bhutan Police by training FoP on prevention and response on GBV and child protection. To capacitate the legal unit of NCWC in carrying out legal support services, with support from this project, a delegation from NCWC undertook a South-South mission to Bangkok to analyze good practices of services for victims of DV.
- ✓ In Phase II, continued support will be provided to initiatives contributing to the creation of a conducive environment to increase opportunities for women to participate in political life at all levels of decision-making through the implementation of the National Action Plan for Gender Equality, including developing the Gender equality policy. The capacities of the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Labour, Parliament and elected representatives at the local level will be strengthened on gender mainstreaming and gender responsive planning and budgeting, building on the support to the Ministries of Education, Health and Agriculture and Forests in 2015 on the same.

4.0 Risk Management

The risk analysis for implementation of this Phase also remains same as identified in Phase I (UNDAF: UN One Programme 2014-2018, page no. 34).

Bhutan as a landlocked country with limited natural resources and a small internal market, is particularly vulnerable to changes in the global economic climate and impact on her main trading partner. The economic transition and rapid economic growth and as Bhutan graduates to middle income country, will have impact on public finances and in particular on development financing (for both the government and the UN). The adoption of Delivering as One (DaO) in part reflects the UN's commitment to the principles of aid effectiveness and this has been carried forward in the UN One Programme.

The next parliamentary election in 2018 will pose political risk to implementation of the project activities. We expect the ruling party to slow down on the implementation of policy works and shift their focus to election. By mid-year of 2018, we expect the Election Commission of Bhutan to restrict any

public gatherings and consultations of public offices. Therefore, in order to prevent delays in implementation, the majority of project activities are planned in 2017.

5.0 MULTI-YEAR WORK PLAN AND THE BUDGET

In terms of the criteria for prioritisation of Vulnerable Groups, the Vulnerability Baseline Assessment Report is yet to be finalised and discussions on priority groups will be done once the report is finalised based on government priorities. The thinking is to prioritise those vulnerable groups that seem to have least support system and or gaps in the programmatic and policy environment. (Based on comment on 1.2.2)

				Plan	ned B	udget	by Yea	ar			
EXPECTED OUTPUTS	PLANNED ACTIVITIES		2016	5 -201	7			20)18		RESPONSIBLE PARTY
		Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	
Outcome 1 Evidence-based o	lecision-making and inclusive policy environment for SDG 16 implementation	and mon	itoring	g towa	ards th	ne atta	ainme	nt of (GNH		
	1.1.1. Produce a gender indicator handbook			Х	Х						NCWC
1.1. Evidence-based data generated to mainstream SDG 16 into national	1.1.2 Carry out a research to assess "Ten years of Democracy in Bhutan"- producing a National Human Development Report		x	x	x	x	х	x			iGNHaS/RUB (tbd)
development processes	1.1.3. A National survey on Violence Against Women (VAW), risk/protective analysis and formative research	х	х	х	x	x	х	x			NCWC
	1.2.1. Provide continued and targeted support to the formulation and review of national disability laws, policies and enabling environment.		x	x	x	x	x	x			GNHC
1.2. Policies developed and legal frameworks reviewed to help protect the rights of women, marginalized	1.2.2. Support the follow up on the recommendations of the Vulnerability Assessment Report. Identify priority vulnerable groups and do in depth analysis on legal environment for PLHIV and key populations.		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	GNHC, MoH
groups and key populations	1.2.3. Support the implementation of recommendations accepted by Bhutan in the first and second cycles of the UPR (Treaty Ratification) including exchange visit for High Level Task Force on Disability.		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	MOFA, Parliament
Outcome 2 Rule of law institu	utions strengthened for enhanced access to justice for women, marginalized g	groups an	d key	popul	ation	(e.g. l	.GBTI,	PLHI	/, PwD)s)	
2.1. Strengthened justice sector strategic planning and coordination	2.1.1. Support justice sector strategic planning (based on Human Rights principles) and the development of a comprehensive sector-wide reform strategy		x	x	x	x					Courts, OAG, JSWSoL

2.2. An ethical, competent and autonomous legal profession is developed for	2.2.1. Support the establishment of a Bar Association/Council, including draft of implementing regulations		x	х	x	x	х				OAG
enhanced justice sector service delivery	2.2.2. Provide continued capacity development support to the Bar Association/Bar Council		x	х	x	x	х				OAG, BNLI
2.3. An effective legal aid system is institutionalized, in line with international	2.3.1. Support the institutionalization of a legal aid system as per the recommendations of the needs assessment report endorsed by the Cabinet		x	x	x	x	x	x			OAG
standards	2.3.2. Provide continued capacity development support towards implementing a new legal aid system	х	х	х	х	х	х				OAG, Parliament
	2.4.1. Support RENEW in establishing legal support services for victims of gender based violence.		х	x	х	х	х	x			RENEW
2.4. Increased access to	2.4.2. Comprehensive support mechanism (Acts, Rules & Regulations, SOPs and guidelines) in place to support survivors of gender-based violence		x	x	x	x	x	x			NCWC, RENEW
justice, legal awareness training, and support services to women,	2.4.3. Establish women and child friendly safe homes with basic services.		х	х	х	х					RENEW
marginalized groups, and key populations	2.4.4. Support Women and Children Protection Unit (WCPU), Royal Bhutan Police in providing services for vulnerable groups and key population.		x	x	x	x					RBP
	2.4.5 Support BNLI on Legal awareness raising activities including training to Judiciary on new laws, legislative review.		x	x	x	x					BNLI, BBS
Outcome 3 Parliament, key g	overnance institutions, and civil society supported to perform core functions	for impro	ved a	ccoun	tabili	t <mark>y, p</mark> ar	ticipa	tion a	nd rep	resen	tation
	3.1.1. Enhance the capacities of parliamentarians to engage constituencies in public oversight and social accountability (Public hearing Manual)		x	x	x	x	x	x			NA / NC
3.1. Enhanced legislative, representation and	3.1.2. Increase constituencies outreach through videoconferencing of committee meetings ("Virtual Zomdu")	х	х	х	х	x					NA / NC, MolC
oversight capacities of the Parliament	3.1.3 Carry out a comprehensive functional review of the committee system rules against best practice	х	х	х	х	х					NA / NC
	3.1.4 Identify 2 to 3 parliamentary committees for targeted and tailored technical support including capacities of committee secretaries	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			NA / NC

3.2. Improved gender-	3.2.1. Support implementation of the National Plan of Action to Promote Gender Equality (Gender Equality Policy)		х	х	х	х				NCWC, GNHC
sensitivity of the Parliament and local governments	3.2.2. Ministry of Finance and other ministries have enhanced knowledge and skills on gender responsive planning and budgeting (GRPB)		x	x	x	x			-	MoF, NCWC
	Sub- Total for Project Activities (USD)									565,202
	Sub- Total for Project Activities (EUR)									504,645
	Project Manager (NOA level)									30,078
	Project Management Support Costs									31,504
	General Management Services (8%)									45,216
	Sub-Total for Project Management (USD)									106,798
	Sub-Total for Project Management (EUR)									95,356
	Grand TOTAL (USD)			672,000						
	Grand TOTAL (EUR)									600,000

UNDP BHUTAN, JULY 2016

6.0 RESULTS FRAMEWORK

Indicators reflected here are indicators from the UNDAF (UN One Programme). Recommendations from the Mid-Term Review of June 2016 (review of UNDAF/UN One Programme Results Framework) has also been incorporated. The UNDAF/One Programme indicators are discussed during the Quarterly and mid-year review meetings with UN implementing partners and GNHC. We will take the suggestions and observations from ADA on the indicators in our next review meetings for Government's consideration. Therefore, the indicators 4.5, 4.6, 4.3.2 of UNDAF (UN One Programme) are focused on women participation and empowerment and would not be possible to include other groups as it also requires discussions with other UN Agencies. For indicator 3.1, the other groups are already included. For the indicator "Number of laws enacted by the parliament as the result of UN engagement since 2014" are human rights complied legislations and is accordingly corrected in the table below.

INDICATORS	Unit	Sub-group	Baselines	Year			TARGETS	;		Means of Verification (per	Expected frequency of new data
					2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	Indicators)	availability (in months)
Outcome 1 Evidence-based de Outcome 3, page nos. 58-61 ar				ent for	SDG 16 im	plementa	tion and	monitorir	g towards	the attainment of GNH (/	inked to UNDAF
Prevalence of domestic violence against women (UNDAF Outcome 3, indicator 3.2, page no. 58)	Percentage	Female 15-49	29	2012				25%		Violence Against Women Study	2017
Percentage of women reporting acceptance of domestic violence (UNDAF Outcome 3, indicator 3.3, page no. 58)	Percentage	Female 15-49	68	2012				45%		Violence Against Women Study	2017
Outcome 2 Rule of law institu		hened for enhan	ced access to	justice f	or women	, margina	lized grou	ups and k	ey populati	ion (e.g. LGBTI, PLHIV, Pv	vDs) (linked to
UNDAF Outcome 3, page nos. 3 Percentage of CEDAW observations incorporated into policies & programmes (UNDAF Outcome 3, indicator 3.4, page no. 58)	Percentage	Total	0						50	CEDAW Observation	2017
Percentage of budget allocated for the effective implementation of Domestic Violence Prevention Act (DVPA)/ implementation Rules & Regulations (IRR) (UNDAF Outcome 3, indicator 3.8, page no. 58)	Percentage	Total	0						20	NCWC Budget	Available in 2017

Percentage of women reporting participation in local decision making (UNDAF Outcome 4, indicator 4.5, page no. 62).	Percentage	Female	7						10	LG election result of 2016 UNDP & UN Women Reports	Annually
Percentage of women reporting participation in National decision making (UNDAF Outcome 4, indicator 4.6, page no. 62).	Percentage	Female	10.6						12	UNDP & UN Women Reports	Annually
Output: 1.1. Evidence-based da	ata generated	to mainstream S	DG 16 into nat	ional de	velopment	processe	s (linked t	o UNDAF	Outcome 4	, Output 4.1, page nos. 62	64)
Proportion of 12th Five Year Plan Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) directly aligned with SDG targets (<i>New UNDAF indicator in the</i> <i>current version- proposed</i> <i>under Output 4.1</i>)	Percentage	Total	134	2013						12th Five Year Plan	2018
Percentage of SDG indicators relevant to Bhutan (under 134 targets) for which at least baseline data is available in Bhutan (New UNDAF indicator in the current version- proposed under Output 4.1)	Percentage	Total		2016						Result of mapping done by UNDP (Baseline) SDG database (international/national)	2018
Proportion of 12th Five Year Plan Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) with full disaggregation when relevant to the target, in accordance with the Fundamental Principals of Official Statistics (New UNDAF indicator in the current version- proposed under Output 4.1)	Percentage	Total		2013						One off analysis of the 5 year plan document and SDG indicators	2015 & 2018

Number of child & gender sensitive and vulnerable group responsive laws and policies in place (UNDAF Outcome 3, indicator 3.1, page no. 58- originally an UNDAF outcome indicator and in the current version moved under Output 3.1)	Number	Total	3				0.000	1	5	Parliament website, GHNHC website	Annually
Output 2.1 Strengthened Justic Comprehensive justice sector strategic plan developed (including OAG) (New UNDAF indicator in the current version- proposed under Output 4.1). Output 2.2. An ethical, compet	Number	Total	0						2	Agency reports	Annually
nos. 58-61) Number of justice and law enforcement professionals with the capacity to (administer justice for Vulnerable Groups (VGs) in contact with the law and implement crime prevention strategies (UNDAF Outcome 3, Output 3.4, indicator 3.4.4- modified to include vulnerable groups in the current version, page no. 61)	Number	Disaggregated data on VGs as identified in the VBA report	N/A						150	Training reports (BNLI, law enforcement agencies)	Annually
Output 2.3 An effective legal a	id system is in	stitutionalized, ir	line with inte	rnationa	al standard	s (linked t	o UNDAF	Outcome	4, Output 4	.5, page nos. 62-66)	
Percentage of civil cases and disputes resolved through alternate dispute resolution mechanisms (UNDAF Outcome 4, Output 4.5, indicator 4.5.2, page no. 66)	Percentage	Total							20	Bhutan National Legal Institute	2016
				t service	s to wome	n, margina	alized gro	ups, and I	key populat	ions (linked to UNDAF Ou	tcome 4, Oເ

Number of service centers (shelter, community support, health) providing services (UNDAF Outcome 3, Output 3.3, indicator 3.3.3 and page no. 60).	Number	Total	4		4	6	7	7	7	Agency reports	Annually
Number of Institutions that engage men and boys to prevent and address Gender Based Violence (GBV) (UNDAF Outcome 3, Output 3.3, indicator 3.3.4- slightly modified in the current version, page no. 60)	Number	Total	1		4	8	12	16	20	RGOB and CSO reports	Annually
Proportion of people aware of basic rights, duties & responsibilities (UNDAF Outcome 4, Output 4.5, indicator 4.5.1, page no. 66)	Percentage	Total	83						90	Mediators' Annual Review Reports (LG) 2016 census	2016
Percentage of elected women in local governments (<i>Outcome 4, Output 4.3,</i> <i>indicator 4.3.2, page no. 65</i>)	Percentage	Total	7		7	7	20	20	20	Election Commission of Bhutan (ECB) report	Annually
Output 3.1 Enhanced legislativ	e, representat	ion and outreach	capacities of	the Parli	ament (linl	ked to UN	DAF Outc	ome 4, Oı	utputs 4.1, 4	I.2, 4.3, page nos. 62-66)	
Number of laws enacted by the parliament (based on HR Principles) as the result of UN engagement since 2014 (New UNDAF indicator in the current version- proposed under Output 4.1)	Number	Total	0	2014						Annual desk review of legislature record keeping and UN programme report by UNDP	Annually
Number of laws amended by the parliament as the result of UN engagement since 2014 (New UNDAF indicator in the current version- proposed under Output 4.1)	Number	Total	0	2014						Annual desk review of legislature recordkeeping and UN programme report by UNDP	Annually

Number of public consultation held by the parliament as the result of UN engagement since 2014 (<i>New UNDAF indicator in the</i> <i>current version- proposed</i> <i>under Output 4.1</i>)	Number	Total	0	2014						Parliament Committee report UN Programme report by UNDP	Annually
Number of integrated community centers with video conference facility (UNDAF Outcome 4. Output 4.2, indicator 4.2.5- modified in the current version, page no. 64)	Number	Total	2	2014	2	47	47	75	80	UNDP Project report	Annually
Percentage of women in Parliament (<i>Outcome 4,</i> <i>Output 4.3, indicator 4.3.1,</i> <i>page no. 65</i>)	Percentage	Female	8.3		8.3	8.3	8.3	8.3	20	National assembly & National Council	Annually
Output 3.2 Improved gender-s	ensitivity of th	e Parliament and	l local governn	nents (Li	nked to UN	IDAF Outo	come 4, O	utputs 4.1	L and Outco	me 3, Output 3.2, page no	s. 58-66)
Number of national and local government institutions that incorporate gender responsive planning and	Number	National Level	0		Pilot in Health	2	3	4	5	Annual budget call notification guideline	Annually
budgeting (GRBP) (Outcome 4, Output 4.1, indicator 4.1.1, page no. 63).		Local Level	0						20	Annual budget call notification guideline	Annually
Number of key Ministries, autonomous bodies, non- governmental organisations and private companies with resourced gender mainstreaming (UNDAF Outcome 3, Output 3.2, indicator 3.2.1, page no. 60).	Number	Total	3		3	10	10	10	10	RGoB & Agency reports	Annually