|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2015  Project Implementation Review (PIR)  of |  |

**PIMS 4073**

**Sustainable Land Management in Shifting Cultivation Areas of Nagaland for Ecological and Livelihood Security**

**Table of Contents**

[A. Basic Project and Finance Data](#_Toc252634155)

[B. Project Contacts and Links](#_Toc252634156)

[C. Project Summary](#_Toc252634157)

[D. Progress toward Development Objective](#_Toc252634158)

[E. Progress in Implementation](#_Toc252634159)

[F. Ratings and Comments on Project Progress](#_Toc252634160)

[G. Project Planning](#_Toc252634161)

[H. Critical Risk Management](#_Toc252634162)

[I. Environmental and Social Grievances](#_Toc252634163)

[J. Communicating Impact](#_Toc252634164)

[K. Partnerships](#_Toc252634165)

[L. Progress toward Gender Equality](#_Toc252634166)

[M. Annex 1 - Ratings Definitions](#_Toc252634167)

# A. Basic Project and Finance Data

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project Implementing Partner: | Soil and Water Conservation Department, Govt. of Nagaland |
| GEF Focal Area: | Multi-Focal Areas |
| Country(ies) | (IND) India |
| Project Start Date: | 20-Jul-2009 |
| Planned Project Closing Date: | 30-Apr-2013 |
| Revised Planned Closing Date: | 31-Dec-2015 |
| Dates of Project Steering Committee/Board meetings during reporting period: |  |
| Total GEF Grant (U$S) | $ 1,800,000 |
| GEF Grant Disbursed as of 30 June (U$S): | $ 0.00 |
| Total Co-financing (as planned in CEO endorsement request): | $ 20,000,000.00 |
| Overall Risk Rating |  |
| Overall DO Rating |  |
| Overall IP Rating |  |

# B. Project Contacts and Links

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Partner | Contact Name | Email Address |
| Project Coordinator / Manager | R. Vitsiatho Nyuwi | vitsiatho.nyuwi@undp.org |
| UNDP Country Office Programme Officer | Lianchawii Chhakchhuak | lianchawii@undp.org |
| Project Implementing Partner | Liammeren Ao |  |
| GEF Operational Focal Point | susheel kumar |  |
| Other Partners | NIL |  |
| UNDP Technical Adviser | Doley Tshering | doley.tshering@undp.org |
| UNDP Programme Associate | Pakamon Pinprayoon | pakamon.pinprayoon@undp.org |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project website, etc. | http://www.in.undp.org/content/india/en/home/operations/projects/environment\_and\_energy/sustainable\_landandecosystemmanagementinshiftingcultivationareas.html |
| Links to media coverage |  |

# C. Project Summary

Develop, demonstrate and upscale sustainable land management practices for the conservation of jhum (shifting cultivation) lands in the North Eastern State of Nagaland through an ecosystem approach.

# D. Progress toward Development Objective

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Objective/Outcome** | **Description** | **Description of Indicator** | **Baseline Level** | **Target Level at end of project** | **Level at 30 June 2013** | **Level at 30 June 2014** | **Level at 30 June 2015** |
| Objective | To develop, demonstrate and upscale sustainable land management practices for the conservation of jhum (shifting cultivation) lands in Nagaland through an ecosystem approach | No change in primary forest cover in project sites | Baseline measured in Y1 | In Y4, improved forest cover or remains the same as in baseline | Improved forest cover, soil and water conservation measures across 18,508.90 Ha. Activities such as jhum fallow management through plantation and bamboo plantation like Alder, tree beans, khokon, local fuel wood and leguminous crops and economically viable crops such as cardamom has helped directly or indirectly. Project implementation strategy for these activities includes participatory planning, awareness creation, institution building for sustainable land and ecological management. | Focused interventions in project areas through participatory planning, awareness creation, institution building for sustainable land and ecosystem management during this reporting period has secured forest cover of approximately 1274 ha through its inclusion in the bylaws of the land use committees formed in the project villages through a participatory process. According to the participatory land use planning carried out in project villages, some land around every village has been demarcated and kept aside as reserve forest by the communities themselves. The action plan of the village land use committees which include resolutions such as leaving 15 to 20 trees standing in every hectare of jhum field, protection of vegetation along water bodies, hill tops and ridges, and maintenance of a buffer zone has helped increase forest cover at the project sites. Interventions and local advocacy movement to increase forest cover by supporting plantation of locally preferred trees that may be used for fruits, fuel-wood and /or timber has added to the green cover of jhum sites. | Active community involvement and sensitization ahead of the jhum slashing season has helped create massive awareness amongst the jhum cultivators. There has been increased forest cover of 4550 hectares through measures such as improved fallow management, maintenance of buffer zones along major streams, rivers and in the jhum areas and creation of new forest areas as proposed in the land use action plans prepared through the participatory land use plans. The Land Use Committees have followed up on the proposed activities and decisions documented in the participatory village action plans and bylaws. |
|  |  | Land area where improved jhum agroforestry systems are in place | 0 | 90,000 hectares of land covering approximately 70 villages in 3 districts by Y4 | Improving jhum agro forestry systems in the three project districts, 12,537.30 ha have been covered through soil and water conservation measures, azolla cultivation, water provisioning and plantations of forest, horticultural and agronomical crops such as cardamom, tree beans, alder tree, bamboo, soya bean, lentil, khokon, Naga neem, gooseberry, terminelia species, schima species, oak tree etc. | As a follow-up to the formation of village land-use committees, and as per the action plan formed by them, the project has extended support in jhum agro-forestry systems with interventions such as inclusion of livestock management, construction of water harvesting ponds and other water provisioning mechanisms for jhum lands, soil and water conservation measures in jhum lands, fallow management measures and plantations. The project has dissuaded local communities from letting the jhum lands, after slashing and burning, from lying completely barren, and having some vegetation cover there instead. About 731 ha of jhum land have been extended direct support during this reporting period. | Further to the land use action plans developed in each of the project villages the project has extended direct support to jhum agro-forestry systems across 2275 hectares through adoption of fallow management practices and replication of soil and water conservation measures. Additionally, 15 water sources have been identified, conserved and protected by the community under the support of the project. |
|  |  | Decrease in rates of soil erosion in project sites | Baseline for project sites to be measured in Y1; erosion rates for the target districts are estimated as: | Same or less than baseline | As per the study conducted by the project team, the soil erosion rate has decreased after project intervention at the rate of 0.2 mt/ha/year. (It\'s the first study on the soil erosion rate conducted in this project) | The soil erosion rate has decreased significantly in the project sites within this reporting period through soil conservation measures, timely plantation of trees in the jhum fields, proper maintenance of fallow land, active involvement of the Village Land Use Committees in mobilising the community to maintain buffer zones and protecting water bodies, streams, hill tops and ridges. The project interventions have led to a noticeable decrease in the rate of soil erosion at the rate of 0.2 mt/ha/year in project areas. | Community sensitization on the importance of soil and water conservation in jhum areas by the LUC through different platforms has led to increased replication of measures such as carrying out timely plantations and placing biomass along the slopes. This has led to a reduction in the rate of soil erosion by about 20.20 mt/ha/year in the project sites. |
|  |  |  | Mokokchung: 60 mt/ha/year | Same or less than baseline | Mokokchung-36-40 mt | Mokokchung-34mt/ha/year | Mokokchung-30mt/ha/year |
|  |  |  | Mon: 40-50 mt/ha/year&nbsp; | Same or less than baseline | Mon-21-25 mt | Mon- 14-24 mt/ha/yr | Mon- 20 mt/ha/yr |
|  |  |  | Wokha: 40-50 mt/ha/year | Same or less than baseline | Wokha-17-20 mt | Wokha- 15-20 m/ha/year | Wokha- 20 mt/ha/year |
|  |  | Increase in incomes of target communities | Baseline to be measured during the project inception phase | 10% improved income | The income of 1008 households in three project districts has increased by 15-20% through access to existing credit facilities, agriculture Revolving fund and sales from increased yield of the jhum fields. | The introduction of soil enrichment measures and high yielding variety of seeds in this reporting period has considerably increased the production rate, thus increasing the average household income in the project villages. The documented increase in income of 1244 households in the three project districts is 20.4 %. Additional income from activities like livestock interventions, credit provisioning facilities, sale of jhum produce, vermi-compost, cash crops like cardamom and tea, tree saplings, and beekeeping have been reported within the reporting period. | A 25% increase in jhum production rate has been recorded in 1710 households during the reporting period. As part of the project, a study on market assessment of jhum produce was conducted in the project area during the reporting period. The findings of the study demonstrated that the average annual sale from jhum produce per family in the project villages is INR 10,723 per annum. The study also revealed that while 63% of the surveyed farmers felt that there had been an increase in production, 78% felt income from agriculture had increased. Of the surveyed farmers, 83% had increased production of cash crops in the last five years, indicating enhanced linkages with the market economy. The increase is attributed to various sustained livelihood interventions of the project, improved Jhum practices, IFD, livestock activities by the community, credit facilities, and promotion of women SHGs through Agriculture Revolving Funds, among others. |
| Outcome 1 | The policy, regulatory and institutional environment in support of jhum agroforestry systems is strengthened | Strengthened Agriculture frameworks that explicitly support enhancing sustainability of jhum systems | Policy does not support enhancing sustainability of jhum systems | Policy explicitly supports enhancing sustainability of jhum systems by Y4 | Community-based, landscape level land use plans have been developed for four villages to strengthen the existing traditional land management systems. Community based Land use committees have been formed to ensure the implementation of the plan. Land use plan will be developed for all the project villages. The plan will include good practice guidelines which outline the key steps and process for stakeholders to come together and discuss how to manage lands sustainability. | To enhance sustainability of jhum systems and strengthen the existing traditional land management systems, community based landscape level land use plans have been developed for 26 project villages in a participatory manner. Land Use Committees (LUCs) were formed exclusively for the management of the Land Use Action Plans drawn up by the community. The LUC is a platform for discussion of all land related issues in the villages and can also act as a conduit for conservation of jhum lands. Efforts have been made to bring the land- use committees under the umbrella of the village councils. This will be completed in all project villages in 2014. Experience sharing on LUC is planned in the month of August 2014 during the District Planning and Development Board meeting at the district levels, wherein all the elected legislatures and government departments examine and recommend replication of the LUP model in the respective districts, beyond the project villages. This will be the first step in influencing the state level agricultural framework. | Completed Participatory Land Use Planning (PLUP) exercises in 9 villages during this reporting period. Dedicated Land Use Committees (LUC) were formed to act as a platform for management and conservation of jhum lands. A field based legal and policy study was completed during the reporting period by Indian Environment Law offices (IELO). The findings of the study identified Participatory Land Use Planning as a critical tool for ensuring long term ecological sustainability of jhum land mangement in the state and recommended that for ensuring the long term sustainability of LUCs established under the project, they should be institutionalized under the umbrella of the Village Council/Village Development Board/Communitization Act. A consultative workshop was conducted with multi-level stakeholders in the state on mainstreaming sustainable jhum practices into existing legal and policy frameworks of Nagaland, where the findings of the study were presented. After considerable deliberations, the stakeholders felt that the Land Use Committees would function best under the Village Councils. Based on the findings of the study and the recommendations, the state government stakeholders have drawn up the following way forward: -The need to have land use policy instead of Jhum land Policy. -The Village Council Act to be considered and moved forward to Home department for review. -Land Use Committees brought under the umbrella of Village Councils or village development board. -To initiate next round of consultative meetings with the NGOs, Land Owners, Local Institutions by the state government |
|  |  | Creating enabling environment in Forest regulations that explicitly recognize and support improved jhum systems as sustainable agroforestry systems that improve forest health | Stresses adverse environmental impact of jhum | Explicit recognition and support for improved jhum systems as sustainable agroforestry systems that improve forest health by Y4 | Participatory land use plan (P3DM), documentation of the traditional land use practices and participatory resource mapping has supported the village council in strengthening the existing regulation on land and forest management. Community based land use action plan provides an enabling environment for improved local ecosystem and livelihood. | Formation of Land Use Committees (LUCs), which have representation from all sections and institutions of the village, including even the usually marginalized sections such as women and landless farmers, and their subsequently formed action plans which addressed issues such as food security and ecosystem balance have created an enabling environment for sustainable jhum and forest management systems. The Action plan of the newly formed LUCs include by-laws for improving forest health and sustainable jhum practices by creation of buffer zones, retention of vegetation on hill tops, protecting and conserving existing water bodies and initiating plantation in fallow lands. These initiatives have supported the village council in strengthening their existing regulations on jhum land and forest management. Legal experts will be hired in August 2014 to assess the relevant legal and policy framework of the state to support promotion of improved sustainable jhum in the state. | Legal experts from Indian Environment Law Offices (IELO) were commissioned to conduct a study for developing a legal and policy framework for the state to support improved sustainable jhum practices integrating the principle of sustainable land and ecosystem management.The IELO team has reported great success of the LUC and PLUP model in the project area. The study has found PLUP and LUC to be enabling tools to support improved jhum systems as sustainable agroforestry systems that improve forest health. The study reported lack of legal status to be a significant weakness of LUC as an institution. Institutionalizing the LUCs as empowered institutions with legal or statutory validity is required. A consultative workshop conducted with multi-stakeholders in the state recommended institutionalizing the LUCs through the state home department by reviewing the Village Council Act. In connection with this, consultative meetings with NGOs, land owners, and local institutions are also to be initiated by the state. |
|  |  | Credit provisioning systems enabled for farmers who work on communally owned lands | No support for extending credit to farmers who work on communally owned lands | Provisions for extending credit to such farmers are integrated into the policy by Y4 | Credit provisioning has been provided to 350 households, including those farmers who work on communally owned lands. | To ensure that the credit provisioning facilities are utilised as planned, credit in livestock has also been initiated in some project villages during the reporting year. Under this provision, beneficiary farmers are provided loans in the form of livestock, and after a certain stipulated period they return the borrowed credit, again in the form of livestock. This system is self-managed by the village land use committees. In this way a revolving credit system in livestock is created, in which the livestock collected are further distributed amongst other needy farmers. This system coupled with agriculture revolving fund has so far supported 180 households (mostly women) in the reporting period. Ten self-help groups (SHGs) have been provided credit facilities by linking them to a bank through a local NGO. This is also a part of the exit strategy for making the SHGs independent and self-sufficient. | An additional 130 households were assisted with credit facilities during the reporting period. The newly initiated credit in livestock scheme that was introduced during the previous reporting period has now been extended to benefit 40 self help groups. The self help groups formed in previous years have demonstrated marked improvement in not only credit management but also book keeping skills through regular monitoring and training. Their concept of SHG and their functioning has also expanded. |
|  |  | Integrated land-use planning at landscape level encouraged and strengthened. | No guidelines | Draft guidelines approved by Y2 | Participatory integrated land use plans have been developed in four villages and approved by the village councils. The same process will be conducted in all the project villages. | Participatory Land use plans in 26 project villages have been developed and further strengthened through follow up meetings. Action plans have been formed in consultation with the village community. Further, the action plans of the villages have been shared with other stakeholders and agriculture and allied departments to ensure synergic convergence. This will be done in all project villages in 2014. | Participatory Land use plans have been completed in the remaining 9 project villages. These have been further strengthened through follow up meetings. Action plans have been formed in consultation with the village community. Further, the action plans of the villages have been shared with other stakeholders and agriculture and allied departments to ensure synergic convergence. The project has also started supporting some of the villages in the implementation of the action plans. Action has also been taken to institutionalize the PLUPs and LUCs under the umbrella of the Village Councils. |
|  |  | Increase in joint extension activities by different departments (agriculture, horticulture, S&amp;WC, land resource development, forest, animal husbandry) | Extension activities are undertaken separately | In target villages all extension services are coordinated according to an integrated plan by Y2 | The project activities are carried out after proper consultation and coordination with other line departments, civil society organizations and local institutions. Local institutions are involved in every level of the project implementations, such as planning, selections, implementations and monitoring of the project. Consultation workshop and paper presentation on Land use plan has been successfully conducted with the line departments and further consultation with the line departments has been planned under the chairmanship of the Agriculture Production Commissioner, government of Nagaland. | The Chief Secretary of Nagaland recommended that the project activities be aligned with the agriculture and allied departmental activities, under the stewardship of the Agriculture Production Commissioner, Government of Nagaland. A number of consultative meetings with line departments have been held under different aegis and platforms during the reporting year. Periodic consultative meetings have been organised with agriculture and allied departments for coordinated implementation of programmes in the targeted areas. The village land-use plans have helped the line departments to work in close coordination and the introduction of new village by-laws to protect jhum and forest lands has brought the different stakeholders under one umbrella for better implementation of the same. | The joint extension work has been carried out in all project districts involving all the line departments under the state co-financing programme initiated by the Agriculture Production Commissioner. The village land-use action plans have helped the line departments to work in close coordination with the Village Land Use Committees and has resulted in increased convergence in the target project villages. Reports of consultative meeting, market assessment surveys etc. conducted by the project have been shared with the line departments, NGOs and various stakeholders to initiate increased joint extension services in marketing of agri-horticultural crops from the state. Under the Agriculture Production Commissioner, the planned activities of market initiatives in the state have been pursued through the agriculture department. Cross learning and farmer exposure field visits from non project areas to project areas have increased joint extension support to the farmers. Japanese International Corporation Agency (JICA), KVK, ATMA, many government stakeholders, soil conservation trainees, students, institutions, farmers, etc have availed of the best practices documented and demonstrated through the Centre of Excellence. |
| Outcome 2 | Options for improving the sustainability of jhum agroforestry systems are developed and demonstrated in selected project sites (70 villages spread over the 3 districts of Mon, Mokokchung and Wokha in Nagaland) | Land productivity indicator (measure of returns from farming calculated as outputs minus inputs, e.g. yield minus inputs) | Baseline measured in Y1 | Productivity improved by 5% over the baseline | The project has not specifically conducted a scientific study or measurement of the output from the jhum fields but it is evident from the semi-structured interviews with the farmers that the quality and quantity of the jhum produce have improved substantially. A technical study on jhum productivity study will be conducted in the year 2013-14. | Primary assessments indicated that there were marked improvements in the production following the interventions of Integrated Farming Approaches to support sustainable jhum agro- forestry systems. The project had conducted a study on market assessment of jhum produce in 26 project villages within the reporting period and found the farmers reported an increase in production levels. A socio-economic impact study will be conducted in the year 2014-15. | The project interventions to improve jhum practices like soil conservation activities (contour bunding, bench terracing, contour trenching, etc), improved irrigation facilities, improved fallow management, and better crop management have improved soil fertility in managed jhum cultivation and fallow areas, thereby resulting in demonstrated high productivity levels. The market assessment study on jhum produce indicated that cash crops were contributing significantly to the village economy and that a majority of small farmers in the project districts were growing small quantities of each of the different types of cash crops in order to diversify and reduce risks. The average annual sale from jhum produce per family in the project area was INR 10723 and 63% of the farmers felt an increase in production while 83% said that they had increased the production of cash crops in the last five years. 78% of surveyed farmers felt income from agriculture had increased in the last five years. The socioeconomic impact assessment study carried out by InSPIRE also reported a 17.6% increase per annum in the annual household incomes of the project villages from the year 2011 to 2014, which was mainly attributed to the successful project interventions. |
|  |  | Lengthening of jhum cropping phase | 2 years | 3 years by Y4 | Through the project intervention on integrated land based, plantations and water based activities, it has improved the sustainability of jhum agroforestry systems and increase in land productivity, thereby increasing the jhum cropping phase from 2 years to 3 years across the three project districts. | The scientific measures for land and water conservation, suitable technical support provided for fallow management, planting nitrogen fixing plants and appropriate intervention measures undertaken for improving soil fertility have significantly lengthened the jhum cropping phase from 2 to 3 years across all the project districts. These successful and promising interventions are also being replicated in other non-project villages. | The socioeconomic and ecological study carried out by InSPIRE during the reporting period has found that the scientific and appropriate intervention measures undertaken for improving soil fertility have significantly lengthened the jhum cropping phase from one to four years in the project areas. These successful interventions have also been replicated in other non-project villages. |
|  |  | Lengthening of jhum fallow phase | 8 years | 9 years | The fallow phase has increased from 8-9 years due to number of factors Ã¢ labour shortage, other gainful employment opportunities, permanent cultivation etc. | As per the data received from local institutions in targeted areas, there is an indication that the fallow phase has witnessed an average increase of 8-9 years. Interestingly, some areas have shown an encouraging trend of increase in fallow period of up to 14 years. The increase in the fallow period may be attributed to a number of factors Ã¢ labour shortage, other gainful employment opportunities, permanent cultivation etc. | Increase in the cropping phase from one to four years in the project areas will also have a spillover positive impact on further lengthening of the fallow phase. The socioeconomic and ecological impact study carried out during the reporting period indicated that the target communities in the project area are willing to increase the jhum fallow phase even though it maybe too early to assess the impact of the project on the jhum cycle. The willingness to increase the fallow phase may be attributed to a number of factors pro active land use committees for improved jhum management practices, improved and judicious management of jhum areas encouraged by the project, labour shortage, other gainful employment opportunities, permanent cultivation etc. |
|  |  | Contribution of income from sale of (organically grown) produce to local economy increases | Baseline measured in Y1 | Increase of 5% over baseline. Effort will be made to include as much as women beneficiaries as possible (say 50%) | Sale of organic grown produce by the women self help groups has reported an increase of annual family income by 15-20% in 1009 households across the three project districts. | According to a study conducted in 25 project villages in three districts, the total estimated value of sales of three most important cash crops (chilli, ginger and colocasia) is approx. Rs 6.7 crore (USD1116667) annually with an average annual sale value per village at Rs. 26.7 lakhs (USD 44,500). A significant portion of this sales value can be directly attributed to the project, which has witnessed a consistent increase in income of project households, by over 15% annually. During this reporting period alone, 1564 households have reported an increased income of 20% from sale of organically grown produce. The introduction of soil enrichment measures in this reporting period have considerably increased the jhum production, thus resulting in increased household income in the project villages. | The market assessment of jhum produce study reported a profit margin of 30-35% from sale of organic produce in the project areas. The study interviewed 101 local traders across the three project districts and found out that the local traders were responsible for more than 50% of the sale of organic produces. The total sale per annum by the 101 traders amounted to approximately INR 30.4 million and the average sale per trader was about INR 300,000. |
|  |  | Number of women benefiting from marketing of produce from jhum fields | Baseline measured in target villages in Y1 | 300 women beneficiaries (100 from each district) | More than 1400 women from the three project districts have directly benefited from marketing of produce from jhum fields in this reporting period. | As organically grown produce from jhum fields increases, the project has witnessed an increase in the number of women directly benefitting from sale of their jhum produce. More than 1664 women have benefited from marketing of produce from jhum fields in this reporting period. The number of women beneficiaries is expected to increase manifold in the days to come, mainly due to the increased role and participation of women in village land use committees and their action plans. Strategies to develop better marketing linkages are also afoot in 2014 which will also positively impact the livelihood of women traders and farmers. | An additional 480 women have directly benefited through succesful project interventions such as credit facilities, marketing of organic produce, sale of livestock etc. in this reporting period. Almost 95% of the traders are women who sell either from market sheds near their village or travel to markets of nearby towns. The average monthly income of women has doubled from INR 1000 to INR 2000 in the project villages. During this reporting period, the project interventions have built on enhancing the marketing capacity of women as well as on creating better market linkages. The women traders in addition to selling jhum produce from their own fields or even their own village, have also started buying jhum produce from the nearby villages for selling through marketing sheds. This has provided livelihood support to the neighbouring villages through enhanced and expanded market for their produce. While sitting in the marketing sheds during the day, majority of the women also carry out additional activities such weaving baskets, knitting, jewellery making etc. Sale of this handicraft items also contribute to an additional income of atleast INR 200 per month. Several of the women also utilize the time spent in the marketing shed to look after young children. |
| Outcome 3 | Enhanced capacity to replicate the projects policy reform and field-level experiences in other parts of Nagaland, as well as in other States of India, where shifting cultivation agro forestry systems are prevalent. | Number of requests from other districts and states to visit project sites and obtain assistance from the Center of Excellence | 0 | At least 5-6 requests by Y4 | Request for GEF-UNDP assisted SLEM project have been received from 28 villages within the project districts and 3 other districts, namely Peren, Phek and Kiphire. Learnings from the project will be replicated at least to two North east Indian states where jhum cultivation is prevalent. | Three districts in other parts of Nagaland as well as another 35 non-project villages in the project districts have submitted requests for replication of GEF-UNDP assisted SLEM project. The project plans to organise an international conference on sustainable jhum practices to share good practices on jhum cultivation in the year 2014-15. | The project in close coordination with the various government line departments, universities, NGOs, and research institutions has been widely disseminating and demonstrating the SLEM principles in the project districts. The best practices demonstrated at the Centre of Excellence have been availed by many government stakeholders, soil conservation trainees, students, institutions like JICA, farmer beneficiaries, etc. Continuous requests for replication and upscaling of learnings from the UNDP-GEF SLEM project from different villages and districts across the state have been received. The state has approved co-financing to upscale the project activities across the state. During this reporting period, an international consultative workshop on mountain ecosystems with a session emphasizing solely on livelihoods and another on sustainable jhum cultivation practices was organized during this reporting period. This facilitated cross-learning and sharing of best practices from across the globe. The multi stakeholder consultative workshop on developing strategies for mainstreaming sustainable jhum practices into exiting legal and policy frameworks of Nagaland was also organized in the state during this reporting period. This has facilitated enhanced capacity of the line departments to replicate the project policy reform and field level experiences. |
|  |  | Plan for extending project strategy to additional villages and districts with associated resource commitments from government | 0 | By Y4, at least 3 more districts have a budgeted plan for replicating | A North East regional workshop on sustainable shifting cultivation practices has been planned for 2013-14 for replication in other states of the region. Within two years of project extension phase, Land Use Plans will be conducted for non-project districts of Nagaland. The Land Use Plan and other good practices from the project will be shared and disseminated to other Agriculture research centers in Nagaland for replication. | The chairperson of the project steering committee had suggested a replication of the project experiences in Tuensang and Kiphire districts with the support of government co-financing. | Government has sanctioned co-financing for replication and scaling up of the project interventions in the state. The funds have been transferred to the project account in July 2015. Project activities will be planned and implemented during the rest of the year. |

# E. Progress in Implementation

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Project Outcomes | Description | Outputs Reported as of 30 June 2015 |
| Outcome 1 | The policy, regulatory and institutional environment in support of jhum agroforestry systems is strengthened | 1. In continuation with the participatory land use planning activities initiated during the previous reporting period, PLUPs were completed in nine project villages along with the formation of the Land Use Committees as recommended by the Village Councils for creating an enabling environment to support a sustainable jhum agro-forestry system. Ensured participation of different stakeholders in the land use planning process including the District Administration, created a wider acceptance of the planning process. 2. A State level consultative workshop has been conducted with multi stakeholders in the State on mainstreaming sustainable jhum practices into existing legal and policy frameworks of Nagaland and has drawn a collective decision to put forward the process of institutionalizing the LUCs through the State home department by reviewing and including them under the Village Council Act. 3. A study on market assessment of jhum produce was completed and the report has been shared with the line departments and Agriculture Production Commission, Nagaland. The recommendations for improving market linkages will be taken forward by the state government. 4. Best practices from the project have been shared and PLUP models showcased at the international consultative workshop held at New Delhi. 5. Sharing of the project experiences and participatory land-use plans (PLUP) at the Centre of Excellence, Zubza of the Soil and Water Conservation department. Inclusion of the PLUP in the two years pre âservice training course at the Centre of Excellence is being approved. 6. Project activities were shared with Agriculture Production Commission, Planning and Coordination and the line departments. 7. Consultative meetings with District Administration, NGOs, entrepreneurs, agriculture and allied departments ,Do Bashis (DBs), village elders, land owners and village councils held as part of mainstreaming sustainable jhum practices into existing legal and policy frameworks of Nagaland |
| Outcome 2 | Options for improving the sustainability of jhum agroforestry systems are developed and demonstrated in selected project sites (70 villages spread over the 3 districts of Mon, Mokokchung and Wokha in Nagaland) | 1. Participatory land Use Planning has been developed for the sustainability of the Jhum agro forestry systems and demonstrated at project villages. The existing un-codified land use planning were documented and improved land management systems was demonstrated and accepted by the village councils with the formation of the Land Use Committees to oversee the action plans and ensure sustainable jhum agriculture practices. Jhum fallow management and soil and water conservation and in-situ tree management at the Jhum fields have been demonstrated as part of the sustainable Jhum agro forestry system. 2. Credit facilities to additional ten self-help groups were extended for improving sustainability of jhum practices and livelihood options through provision of quality seeds and timely credit facilities. 3. Improved jhum activities such as soil conservation measures, creation of buffer zones, local tree plantations, water conservation measures and inclusion of livestock management were adopted into jhum agro-forestry systems. 4. Working in close collaboration with the other agriculture extension institutes like KVK to provide field demonstration, training, and distribution of improved seeds and dissemination of innovative farming techniques to farmers 5. Introduction of livestock loan system (where one has to return the livestock after a certain period and so on) in order to reduce complete dependence on jhum systems. |
| Outcome 3 | Enhanced capacity to replicate the projects policy reform and field-level experiences in other parts of Nagaland, as well as in other States of India, where shifting cultivation agro forestry systems are prevalent. | 1. Exposure visits to the project sites by line departments, GIS & remote Sensing department and external agencies like JICA for cross-learning of field level experiences 2. Information sharing and cross-learning exposure opportunities for replication to other villages with the state government departments 3. An international consultation workshop on mountain ecosystems, with particular emphasis on sustainable jhum practices was conducted during the reporting period where best practices on sustainable jhum management techniques from across the globe was discussed. 4. The project personnel have undergone skill up-gradation training on GIS. 5. Co-financing amount has been sanctioned by the state to replicate and upscale the field level experiences from the project across the state. The activities for this are being planned for the rest of the year. |

# F. Ratings and Comments on Project Progress

**Project Progress toward Development Objective**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Role | 2015 Rating | 2015 Comments |
| Project Manager/Coordinator | Satisfactory | The project is the only sustainable shifting cultivation project in the region and has been widely acknowledged and appreciated by everyone. This is not only because of the unique nature of the project but also due to the far-reaching positive impact the project has had through its various participatory approach interventions and community prioritised schemes. The Chief Secretary of Nagaland who was also the chairperson of the project steering committee while appreciating the project and its achievements, had also displayed his sincere commitment and support towards the project and keen interest in resolving issues involving the state government. The project has strengthened the capacity of local communities and institutions towards planning and implementation of natural resource use and preservation. As Naga communities are a closely linked society, strengthening local institutions is a very important step towards securing sustainable resource management. In this reporting period, the project could put in place a strong policy implication on jhum agroforestry and land use planning at the village level. Formation of village land use committees and their participatory land use planning exercises and action plans have outlined the key steps and process for stakeholders to come together and discuss how to manage lands for the benefit of present and future generations to ensure livelihood security and ecological sustainability of lands and resources. The land-use committee formed with equal participation of all sections of society and involvement of all existing village institutions (especially ensuring involvement of women and youth) have resulted in formulation of land-use action plans and resolutions. New village council bye-laws for supporting forest health and improved and sustainable jhum practices have been undertaken, which includes activities such as declaration of community conservation areas, creation of buffer zones, retaining plantations on hill tops, protecting and conserving existing water bodies and initiating re-plantation in fallow lands. The project through its strategic and scientific interventions has improved the forest cover, soil fertility and soil and water conservation measures. It has also decreased the rate of soil erosion in the project sites by 20.20 m/ha/year. Experiences of the project on sustainable land and ecosystem management (SLEM) have been shared with the trainees and lecturers of the soil and water conservation departmentâs Zubza Training Centre (Centre for Excellence) and discussions with the centre board is in place for inclusion of such sustainable management principles into their curriculum. The revised curriculum with inclusion of SLEM principles is expected to commence from the next batch of new trainees of the department. |
| UNDP Country Office Programme Officer | Satisfactory | This is the last year of project implementation. A key highlight of the project during this reporting period is the Nagaland Governmentâs contribution of USD 1 million to support scaling up of project activities. The first tranche of USD 380,000 was released in late June 2015. The project has achieved some of the key results outlined in the project document. While some activities have exceeded the planned targets, initiatives are currently underway to achieve stronger and tangible results under some outputs. This project has significant potential for shaping policies and guidelines related to shifting cultivation in Nagaland. The participatory land use planning (PLUP), and the land use committees established therein, is the first of its kind in the state with learnings that have policy implications that can change land use decisions in Nagaland. The legal and policy review undertaken in the project underlines the potential of the PLUP to be institutionalised through amendments in the relevant legal and institutional framework. Amongst others, the report emphasized the complexity of the land tenurial systems in Nagaland and underscored the need for a jhum land policy, including stronger jhum land resource inventory, as well as a state land use policy. This year, the project will focus on the policy, regulatory and institutional linkages based on learnings from the project. In addition, the project will focus on creating a common platform for interdepartmental coordination for sustainable jhum promotion at the district and village levels. The socio-economic impact studies conducted by an independent agency in the last year of the project indicate the positive impacts made by the project on the livelihood as well as ecological security of the local communities in the project areas. Ecosystem services have been maintained or restored in many shifting cultivations areas in the three project districts largely due to better understanding amongst the local communities about the benefits derived from it. Increased income from sales of farm produce have led to improved livelihoods contributing to the local economy. The socio-economic impact study revealed a 17.6 per cent annual increase in household income in the project villages from 2011-2014 and 25 per cent increase in jhum production of 1710 households. The agriculture revolving fund (ARF) has been increased from 30 to 40 self-help groups and several sub-groups. A market assessment of jhum produce conducted in the last year of the project also indicates a profit margin of 30-35 per cent from sale of organic produce. The study also reported that 63 per cent of the farmers surveyed mentioned an increase in agricultural production while 78 per cent felt that income from agriculture had increased. 83 per cent of the farmers mentioned an increase in the production of cash crops which indicated linkages with the local economy. Over the years, through direct and indirect intervention, more than 30,000ha of forest land has been conserved in partnership with the local communities. Soil erosion has also reduced tremendously due to the soil conservation measures undertaken in the project. Due to improved soil fertility, the cropping period has increased from 2 to 3 years whereas. The participation of women in land use committee as members, coupled with their rising income from ARF and sales of jhum produce, have indirectly strengthened their status in the community and prominence in the social hierarchy. It is interesting to note that a majority of the loans under the ARF managed by the women SHGs are used for financing the education of their children. At the same time, through the learnings demonstrated in the project there is scope for institutionalising the role of women in Naga society. This is a challenging task, but the project will continue to focus on this long term goal by working closely and strategically with the traditional institutions. |
| Project Implementing Partner |  |  |
| GEF Operational Focal point |  |  |
| Other Partners |  |  |
| UNDP Technical Advisor |  |  |

**Project Progress in Project Implementation**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Role | 2015 Rating | 2015 Comments |
| Project Manager/Coordinator | Satisfactory | Most of the activities planned in Annual Work Plans of the reporting period have been successfully implemented. The projectâs various initiatives and activities such as participatory land-use plans, integrated farm development, self-help groups, agriculture revolving funds and micro-credit facilities, soil and water conservation measures among others have shown far reaching positive impacts and appreciation from the various line departments and local communities. Horticulture, agroforestry plantations and soil and water conservation measures have improved the vegetation cover in the project sites. The project impacts and results were shared with the government, and the state government has received recommendations and requests to replicate the project activities and learnings in other villages and districts of the state. Market assessment and survey of agricultural produce from jhum lands was carried across the three project districts within the reporting period. The findings of the study and subsequent strategies developed for improving market linkages is expected to strengthen and improve the livelihood generation of local communities through increased sale of organic produce from jhum fields. Participatory land use plans have been completed in the project villages (and ongoing), with the purpose of selecting and adopting land use practices that will best meet the needs of the people while safeguarding natural resources for the future. The codification of land use decisions in a formalised context has helped create a platform for community land use decisions. The PLUP will help address conservation challenges such as rampant burning of jhum fields, protection of forest and water bodies, land degradation etc. Land use committees have been formed in the project villages and monitoring has been initiated towards the four points action plan formulated by the committee â a) protecting water sources and gullies by not slashing and burning along them b) maintaining vegetation in a buffer of 50 feet on both sides of streams and water bodies c) preserving vegetation on the hill top and ridges d) keeping at least 15-20 trees per hectare on jhum fields during slashing before cultivation. Strengthened coordination and convergence mechanisms have been created between line departments through better awareness of linkages between land degradation, forest resources and rural development. The sustainable land management principles and project experiences have been shared at Zubza Training Centre. After many discussions and meetings with the state government at different levels on co-financing from the state government, recommendations have been made by the government to co-finance the project interventions through centrally sponsored schemes such as RKVY and IWMP. The state has released cofinance amount for the upscaling and replication of project interventions across the state. These will be completed in the remaining part of the year. |
| UNDP Country Office Programme Officer | Satisfactory | The project delivered 100 per cent of the annual budget in 2014. The state committed to support the project with USD 1 million to scale up the project activities. An approximate amount of USD 380,000 was released in early July 2015. Due to the unexpected delay in release of funds from the state government, and the limited budget available from GEF funding, there was a lull in field activities, including the implementation of land use plans. During this period, most of the activities were focused on preparation of Participatory Land Use Plans (PLUPs) with the project villages with a view that these plans would be implemented once funds were released by the state government. There will be minor changes in the management structure under the new funding mechanism. Fresh support staff will be recruited to support project implementation. At the same time, the extension workers of the soil and water conservation department will also be trained to continue some of the activities undertaken in the project, such as the PLUP and PRA activities. In addition, the curriculum of the training centre for the extension workers of the soil and water conservation department will incorporate SLEM principles, including the PLUP. A terminal evaluation will be conducted in the third quarter of 2015. The selection process for the TE is underway. The last year focuses on a mix of field level implementation activities as well as wrapping up some of the key components. The remainder of the project will focus on sustaining the key activities undertaken in the project by institutionalising some of the components while also looking at the policy level linkages. Given the short time left till the project closure, strategic interventions will be made to ensure optimum results. |
| Project Implementing Partner |  |  |
| GEF Operational Focal point |  |  |
| Other Partners |  |  |
| UNDP Technical Advisor |  |  |

# G. Project Planning

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Key project milestone** | **Status** | **Original Planned Date (Month/Year)** | **Actual or Expected Date (Month/Year)** | **Comments** |
| **Inception Workshop** |  | **-** | **-** |  |
| Mid-term Review |  | - | - |  |
| Terminal Evaluation |  | - | - |  |

# H. Critical Risk Management

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Critical Risks Type(s) | Critical Risk Management Measures Undertaken in 2015 |

# I. Environmental and Social Grievances

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Related environmental or social issue |  |
| Status |  |
| Significance |  |
| Detailed description |  |

# J. Communicating Impact

|  |
| --- |
| Tell us the story of the project focusing on how the project has helped to improve peoples lives. |
| Nagaland, one of the âSeven Sisterâ states of India, is located at the confluence of the Indo-China and Indo-Myanmar region. Endowed with rich species diversity, Nagaland is also home to 16 major tribes and many sub tribes. Shifting cultivation, locally referred to as jhum, is the main form of agriculture practised by majority of the people. Nagaland is facing a major ecological challenge in recent years, with shortening of the duration of jhum cycles from 15 years to 5-8 years, thus causing a decline in production and yield over time as there is insufficient time for restoring soil fertility and the natural regeneration process. The project has introduced a codified system of Participatory Land Use Planning (PLUP) for improved jhum production systems to meet the challenge of increasing population and changing lifestyles, while also maintaining the ecological sustainability of the system. Participatory Land Use Planning has been completed in the project villages to encourage landscape and village level land use planning process for sustainable land and ecosystem management to ensure ecological and livelihood security. The first community planning at landscape level in the state involved various stakeholders including village councils, representatives from clans, youth, students, landless and women. The intensive two week-long planning exercise includes field visits, socio-economic surveys, oral interpretations, PRAs, sharing of findings and recommendations and deriving village action plan culminating in the formation of Land Use Committees (LUC) with the approval of the village councils. LUCs have been instrumental in creating awareness amongst the Jhum cultivators. This has ensured improved forest cover by 4550 hectares through better fallow management, active follow up by LUCs on participatory village action plans and bylaws, maintaining buffer zones along major streams, rivers and in the jhum areas, replication of soil and water conservation measures and creation of new forest areas. Additionally, during this reporting period, 15 new water sources have been identified, conserved and protected with project support. It was felt that institutionalising of LUCs to empower them for better and sustainable functioning as an institution with legal or statutory validity was required. Hence, a legal firm was commissioned for developing strategies for mainstreaming sustainable jhum practices into existing legal and policy frameworks of Nagaland. Further consultative meetings with NGOs, land owners, and local institutions are to be initiated by the state government in this matter. It has been further proposed that LUCs be brought under the umbrella of the village councils. Improved diverse soil and water conservation methods and timely fallow management measures in project areas have reduced soil erosions rate by about 20.20 mt/ha/year. The soil fertility in the project areas has improved where 63% of the farmers felt an increase in production from jhum areas. Increased income of 25% has been recorded from 1710 households during 2014-15. Integrated Farm Development (IFD), micro credit facilities, seed bank facilities, credit through livestock facilities and market sheds have increased income of the targeted communities by 30% to 35%. The marketing capacity of women in the project areas have been enhanced and good market linkages have been created. 480 women traders have started buying jhum produce from the nearby villages for selling through marketing sheds, in addition to selling jhum produce from their own fields or even their own village. This has provided livelihood support to the neighbouring villages through enhanced and expanded market for their produce. While sitting in the marketing sheds during the day, majority of the women also carry out additional activities such weaving baskets, knitting, jewellery making etc. Sale of this handicraft items also contribute to an additional income of atleast INR 200 per month. Several of the women also utilize the time spent in the marketing shed to look after young children. The SLEM project addressing the land degradation is very relevant to the areas where intensive Jhum agriculture is being practised. Working in close coordination with the line departments, Universities, NGOs, Research Institutions, the SLEM principles have been demonstrated and disseminated widely. Moreover, the LUCs formed at the village level s have become a convergence platform for the line departments. The best practices demonstrated at the Centre of Excellence have been availed by many government stakeholders, soil conservation trainees, students, farmers, etc. The involvement of women and landless people in the community based PLUP had wide publication and acceptance. The LUC, a discussion forum for land related issues has enabled the community to plan and monitor their own resources in a sustainable manner. |
| What is the most significant change that has resulted from the project this reporting period? |
| The project has introduced a codified system of Participatory Land Use Planning (PLUP) for improved jhum production systems to meet the challenge of increasing population and changing lifestyles, while also maintaining the ecological sustainability of the system. Participatory Land Use Planning has been completed in the project villages to encourage landscape and village level land use planning process for sustainable land and ecosystem management to ensure ecological and livelihood security. The first community planning at landscape level in the state involved various stakeholders including village councils, representatives from clans, youth, students, landless and women. The intensive two week-long planning exercise includes field visits, socio-economic surveys, oral interpretations, PRAs, sharing of findings and recommendations and deriving village action plan culminating in the formation of Land Use Committees (LUC) with the approval of the village councils. LUCs have been instrumental in creating awareness amongst the Jhum cultivators. This has ensured improved forest cover by 4550 hectares through better fallow management, active follow up by LUCs on participatory village action plans and bylaws, maintaining buffer zones along major streams, rivers and in the jhum areas, replication of soil and water conservation measures and creation of new forest areas. Improved diverse soil and water conservation methods and timely fallow management measures in project areas have reduced soil erosions rate by about 20.20 mt/ha/year. The soil fertility in the project areas has improved where 63% of the farmers felt an increase in production from jhum areas. Increased income of 25% has been recorded from 1710 households during 2014-15. Integrated Farm Development (IFD), micro credit facilities, seed bank facilities, credit through livestock facilities and market sheds have increased income of the targeted communities by 30% to 35%. |
| Describe how the project supported South-South Cooperation and Triangular Cooperation efforts in the reporting year. |
| The UNDP - India country office organized in collaboration with the state government of Nagaland an international consultative workshop on mountain ecosystems with particular emphasis on sustainable jhum management practices and livelihood development. There was a showcase of best practices from across the globe for cross-learning and knowledge exchange from similar agro-forestry systems. |

# K. Partnerships

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Partners | Innovation and Work with Partners |
| Civil Society Organisations/NGOs | The project continues to work in close coordination with local institutions such as Village Councils and its affiliate local bodies comprising of women, student, church and farmersâ groups. The land-use committees formed under the village council actively monitor the land-use action plans and its implementation. Credit provisions in livestock have also been initiated under the project which is managed by the village land use committee. Self-help Groups have been provided credit facilities by linking them to the bank through an NGO working exclusively on this. |
| Indigenous Peoples | All the beneficiaries and stakeholders of the project are indigenous people. The project works with four tribes of Nagaland; Ao, Lotha, Konyak and Sumi. They are involved in planning and implementation of project activities. All project implementation decisions are taken in consultation with the village council which is the existing traditional institution comprising of the indigenous people. |
| Private Sector |  |
| GEF Small Grants Programme |  |
| Other Partners |  |

# L. Progress toward Gender Equality

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Has a gender or social assessment been carried out this reporting period? | Yes |
| If a gender or social assessment has been carried out what where the findings? | During this reporting period a social assessment with particular emphasis on gender was carried out through Participatory Rural Appraisal and Participatory Land Use Planning in the project villages. The assessment clearly highlighted the prevailing local customary practices which restrict Naga womenâs right to land, even though they have the maximum engagement with the land through agricultural practices. The traditional Naga customs discourage women to participate and have a say in decision making bodies (Village Councils), thereby limiting their rights to contribute to and directly access information. They are also restricted by little or no access to credit facilities which are essential for investment in improved farm practices. The project has included women in key decision making bodies regarding land use planning by creating a conducive platform â the Land Use Committee under the umbrella of the village council. Through this platform, women are able to contribute and have direct access to information regarding land resources and sustainable jhum management practices. The project has also demonstrated that an effective means of supporting the women of the targeted communities is through support to omenâs self help groups. Forty four women SHGs were provided with credit facilities to enhance their capacity to invest and deliver results. Income of these women has improved by 25% and atleast 330 women have been able to pay their childrenâs school fees, make home improvements, as well as invest in other livelihood activities, etc. The project also focuses on building the capacity of Naga women through trainings and spot demonstrations. Approximately 450 women have been trained in improving their skills and knowledge on better crop management, soil and water conservation, book keeping, livelihood options, etc through project support. There have been several success stories of change that have happened in Nagaland thanks to the interventions of the project. One such instance is the case of the Meyongpen SHG supported by the project which has purchased a clan land on lease for 40 years. This brave and significant initiative has fanned the hopes and dreams of women of their village, and other surrounding villages to strive for what had earlier seemed impossible to an achievable reality. |
| Does this project specifically target woman or girls as direct beneficiaries? | Yes |
| Please specify results achieved this reporting period that focus on increasing gender equality and improving the empowerment of women. | There has been a significant change in terms of decision making and role of the women in the family and the society. Introduction of various income generation activities through women self-help groups has resulted in increase of annual family income. Her role is not limited to field and household chores but as a major contributor to village economy. The women Self Help Groups have been trained in maintaining accounts, book keeping and sensitized about the purpose of SHGs and the concept of revolving fund and the potential for scaling it up into a micro-credit facility for the village. They have also been technically trained on forest and crop management. |

General Comments

The project specifically targets to include women in key decision making body regarding to land use planning by creating a conducive platform -Land Use Committee (LUC) within the local body- Village Councils. Representation of women in this platform is 15%. Through this platform, the women are able to contribute and have direct access to information. The women are now able to address more on women oriented programmes and most importantly on water issues that affects a large majority of women fetching water from as long as 1-2 km by footh . About 6 existing water source have been conserved and protected to have access to clean water, about 8 water ponds have been constructed to ease their drudgery.

Awareness of the importance of conserving agro biodiversity to 65 women has led to voluntary initiatives to conserve the existing local crop biodiversity by the local women body. About 50-64 types and land races of commonly used local Jhum crops are conserved.

The project have also identified that a major means of supporting the women folk of the targeted community is through the support to the self help groups. Women SHGs are provided with credit facilities to enhance their capacity to invest and deliver results. Income of these women has improved by 25 %.

Assessment in about 104 women income utilization through the project initiatives shows that about 43% of women invest their income in children education- to pay for their children school fees, 30% in meeting household needs and home improvements, and 27 % in livelihood activities.

The project focus on Building the capacity of the women folk through trainings and spot demonstrations in about 450 women have helped in improving their skills and knowledge on crop improvement, soil and water conservation ,book keeping etc.

An SHG âMeyongpenâ supported by the project has muster up the courage to purchase a clan land on lease for 40 years to invest on farming, breaking the traditional norm of women ownership on land. This brave and significant initiative by the women SHGs have encouraged and given room for hopes to many women in their village to strive for what seem impossible to possibility.

# M. Annex 1 - Ratings Definitions

**Development Objective Progress Ratings Definitions**

*Highly Satisfactory (HS):*  Project is expected to achieve or exceed all its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as 'good practice'.

*Satisfactory (S):* Project is expected to achieve most of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings.

*Moderately Satisfactory (MS):* Project is expected to achieve most of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve some of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits.

*Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU):* Project is expected to achieve of its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only some of its major global environmental objectives.

*Unsatisfactory (U):* Project is expected not to achieve most of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits.

*Highly Unsatisfactory (HU):* The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, any of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits.

**Implementation Progress Ratings Definitions**

*Highly Satisfactory (HS):* Implementation of all components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be presented as 'good practice'.

*Satisfactory (S):* Implementation of most components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only few that are subject to remedial action.

*Moderately Satisfactory (MS):* Implementation of some components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with some components requiring remedial action.

*Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU):* Implementation of some components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with most components requiring remedial action.

*Unsatisfactory (U):* Implementation of most components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.

*Highly Unsatisfactory (HU):* Implementation of none of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.