## Implementation Partner Monitoring and Verification Mission

1. **Names of Team Members**
   - Mohamed Ahmed Yusuf – UNDP/PPU Programme Analyst

2. **Dates**
   - 24 – 25 January 2018

3. **Name of Partner:**
   - UNDP/REINTEG PROJECT – SiDO NGO (Implementing Partner)

4. **Name of Project:**
   - UNDP/Re-Integ Project – Innovative durable solutions for IDPs and returnees in Mogadishu through enhanced governance, employment and access to basic and protective services

5. **Duration and Amount of Agreement:**

6. **Places visited:** Ceel-barwaaqo IDP Camp, Community Center, 4 Class Rooms, Office, Toilets, Office of SiDO NGO and IDC Location For Verification of The Beneficiaries

7. **Notable Persons Met:**
   1. Bakar Xaaji Omar Muxyadiin – Project manager for Durable Solution for IDPs Project - 0615538652
   2. Ali Ahmad Mohamud – Finance Officer for Durable Solution for IDPs Project - 0615497749
   3. Abdullahi Ali Jimcaale – Director of SIDO – 0615500680
   4. Hussein Abdullahi Hassan – IDC Call Center Manager – 0615808292
   5. Mohamud Abdullaali Mohamed – IDC Field Monitor – 0615816681
   6. Shugri Mohamud Hassan – Field Monitor – 0615908353
   7. Jibril Hassan Ahmad – Field Monitor – 0615909439
   8. Sitey Abdi Osman – IDP Women
   10. Fartuun Siidow Macallim – Supervisor (Group B) - 0615868823
   11. Hussein Mohamud Ali – Supervisor (Group A) – 0615437669
   12. Jibril Khalilf Hassan – Supervisor (Group C) – 0615037775
   13. Hussein Mohamed Omar – Supervisor (Group D) - 0615770838
8. PROGRAMMATIC MONITORING

Before I got to the Office of SIDO and IDP at Deeq Rabi Camp at Kaxda Settlement, Amren - POQA, Seleni - Project Manager and I discussed cash for work activities for PHASE I to monitor that are included constructing five (5) water Kiosks, twenty-five (25) toilets, one (1) community center, four (40 class rooms and one (1) office. In addition, the Project Manager briefed that PHASE I of the project will end last week of January 2018. However, the SIDO did not submit any footages/photos/documentary from cash for work activities, but submitted reports. Therefore, PM recommended to capture evidence based information from the activities which SiDO implemented at the IDP camp in Kaxda Settlement to enable help processing the payment of the beneficiaries through Dhabshiil as the phase I close out is at the end of this month – January, 2018. Furthermore, PM told that IDP committee is in place and it is not clear who is going to pay if the project completed which is also needed to verify how the committee will continue their role if the project end.

Besides to that, Seleni _ PM shared with me the reports on sensitization on hygiene of IDPs at Deeq Rabi Camp, bi-weekly reports covered 23/11/2017 to 04/01/2018 and 6th – 17th January 2018 and list of project beneficiaries to understand the status for the implementation of the cash for work activities. Moreover, we have agreed also to engage iDC – Third Party Monitoring for the verification of the beneficiaries through call center.

9. MONITORING OF THE CASH FOR WORK ACTIVITIES AT DEEQ RABI CAMP:

On 24 January started the monitoring of the project implementation, I held a courtesy meeting together with SIDO Director and its Project staff where I briefed them of the objective of my mission to Deeq Rabi IDP Camp which is supported by Innovative Durable solution for IDPs, verification of the project implementation work plan including human resources, cash for work activities initiatives to employ economically active 300 IDPs including inception workshops, selection of the beneficiaries, procurement of CfW tools and equipment & construction materials, assessments, awareness campaign, signboards, preparation of BoQ and supervision of the work. Furthermore, SIDO facilitated me to conduct monitoring for overall project interventions at all levels. I visited cash for work activities taking place at Deeq Rabi Camp. My visit really coincided when the laborer from IDPs conducting clean-up activities at Deeq Rabi Camp and I have been given an opportunity to attract with some among IDPs women and men who were involved for clean-up activities.

9.1. Main findings from the monitoring of the Cash for Work Activities (Clean-up) are summarized below:

- 160 IDPs members are involved to the clean-up of the IDP camp, 25 IDPs worked the construction of community hall, 25 IDPs for building four class rooms and one office, 70 IDPs for toilets, and 25 for construction of five kiosks. Furthermore, when the labors completed the work of the construction of the structures, they immediately join to clean-up project which is the largest cash for work activities which is on-going the whole month.
• Labors from IDP start the clean-up work in 08:00 am up to 13:00pm
• Labors of clean-up activity do not work on Thursday and Friday (weekend)
• In the morning before they start the work, each labor sign attendance sheet, although some of them may not attend every day clean-up work as seen in the attendance on 24 January 2018
• The labors of the clean-up informed me that they will work for clean-up in 30 days which they earn 5 USD/day
• Gender Disaggregated of cash for work laborer are in the matrix-I:

PHOTOS – Clean – up activities.

9.2. The main findings noted during the monitoring of the supervisors are summarized in the below table:

The number of the supervisors that has been recruited were 10 as the project team informed me which is inline as per the project plan who are supposed to be qualified monitor, supervise and guide the implementation of the cash for work activities. However, I met four (4) supervisors and discussed with them their function and roles, their education levels and experience, when they have started the work for IDP project, salary they earn from the project, how often they report to whom and total number of labors which they supervise.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name of the supervisor</th>
<th>To whom report</th>
<th>Function and role</th>
<th>Number of Labors supervised</th>
<th>Education level</th>
<th>Yrs of Experience</th>
<th>Date started the work</th>
<th>Salary/month</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Hussein Mohamudali</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Supervise cash for work activities, ensure the</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Bachler</td>
<td>One Year and half</td>
<td>23 Dec, 2017</td>
<td>300 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Responsibilities</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>Years</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Amount</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Fartuun Siidow macallin</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Supervise cash for work activities, ensure the attendance Sheet is being signed in every day by Labors, Sanitation awareness for IDPs, garbage collection systems and ensure garbage pits are properly prepared</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Nursing</td>
<td>3 Years</td>
<td>23 Dec, 2017</td>
<td>300 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Jibriil Kahiif Hassan</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Supervise cash for work activities, ensure the attendance Sheet is being signed in every day by Labors, Sanitation awareness for IDPs, garbage collection systems and ensure garbage pits are properly prepared</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Diploma IT</td>
<td>2 Years</td>
<td>23 Dec, 2017</td>
<td>300 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Hussein Mohamed Omar</td>
<td>Project Manager</td>
<td>Supervise cash for work activities, ensure the attendance Sheet is being signed in every day by Labors, Sanitation awareness for IDPs, garbage collection systems and ensure garbage pits are properly prepared</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Undergraduate</td>
<td>3 Years</td>
<td>23 Dec, 2017</td>
<td>300 USD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
9.3. Main findings from the Monitoring of the water Kiosks constructed in the IDP Camp:

- I have seen five kiosks dispersed to the IDP camp at Deeq Rabi
- The construction of the 5 kiosks has been almost completed, although there is a need to accomplish the fixing taps.
- Water Kiosks are almost in place but are not functioning where the IDPs are not fetching water from the water point.
- I checked the measurement of the water structure and found that 2m x 1.30m with six taps for each.
- The Kiosks are dispersed along the IDP settlement that each kiosk is supposed to provide water for all people living in Deeq Rabi Camp.
- 25 labors who accomplished the construction of kiosks has been engaged immediately to attend the clean-up activities
- SIDO did not undertake the Kiosks procurement processes, but compiled procurement of the buildings has been done in one time
- The procurement processes were fully complied to standards and procedure of UNDP – bidding committee, advertisement, bidding, bid selection, bid selection, awarding and contracting

PHOTOS – CONSTRUCTION OF WATER KIOSKS
9.4. Main findings from the monitoring of community center, class rooms and Office are summarized below:

- The building of the community hall completed and function for this month – the community run their meetings, awareness on sanitation and supervisors use as an office to do attendances of the laborers.
- The verified measurement of the community center is 7m x 14m, with seven windows of 1m x 1.5m.
- The ventilation of the community center is most appropriate to the climatic condition of the area as it has seven (7) windows and door.
- The building of four (4) class rooms completed with the size of 3m x 6m x 22m. Each class covers 3m x 5m x 6m with two windows and one door.
- The building of one office completed with the size of 3mx 4m x 4m.
- SIDO did not undertake the Kiosks procurement processes separately, but compiled procurement of the buildings has been done in one time.
- The procurement processes were fully complied to standards and procedure of UNDP – bidding committee, advertisement, bidding, bid selection, bid selection, awarding and contracting.
- All structures have been made for woods with iron sheets which are not durable solution for the purpose as per this required to be. However, these structures will be immediately demolished by the corrosive from the Indian Ocean.
9.5. Main findings from the monitoring of the Toilets:

- I have counted 27 toilets which twenty-five (25) toilets funded by reinter project, but other extra two (2) toilets contributed by SIDO for the purpose of the girls who will join the schools.
- The size of each toilet was 1.5m x 1.5m x 2m
- The visibility of the toilets was very clear as the funding agency and implementing agencies with their logo appeared on the iron sheets built for toilets (EU Re-integ Project, Implementing – UNDP/SIDO).
- SIDO did not undertake the Kiosks procurement processes separately, but compiled procurement of the buildings has been done in one time.
- The procurement processes were fully complied to standards and procedure of UNDP – bidding committee, advertisement, biding, bid selection, bid selection, awarding and contracting.

- Photos – BUILDING OF TOILETS
9.6. Other findings from the Recruitment of the Key Project Human Resources:

- The Project has other Project Staff Including Engineer, Project Manager and Finance Officer. I have met with the Project Manager and Finance Officer, but the Project Engineer did not appear in the meeting.
- SIDO did not go through regular recruitment processes and immediately engaged its permanent staff for jobs of the project.
- In addition, the senior staff members of the project are gender bias as all men engaged for the above-cited positions.
- I held one to one meeting with the Project Manager and Finance Officer and they confirmed that they receive their full salary as the project plan (3000 USD/each)
- During the discussion with the finance officer, Issues Identified During Monitoring Visit to UNDP//Re-Integ Project – Innovative durable solutions for IDPs at Deeq Rabi:

9.7. Gender Disaggregated Data as Identified by SIDO:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Cash for Work Activities</th>
<th>Number of workers</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Clean-up for IDP Camp</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Building of Community Hall</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Building of 4 class rooms and one office</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Building of Toilets</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Construction of Kiosks</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>300</strong></td>
<td><strong>207</strong></td>
<td><strong>93</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 10. Main Issues Identified During the Monitoring Visit for the Beneficiaries and Implementing Partner:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Proposed Solution/Way Forward</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Questionable findings from the assessment of IDP cash for work activities is that the number of supervisors verified currently serving for the CfW of clean-up campaign were 4 while the rest of the supervisors need to be verified</td>
<td>Other six (6) supervisors need to be verified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Other remarkable findings is – not shared with me and observed the recruitment procedures of the supervisors from documents checked which were available in the office of SIDO</td>
<td>SIDO should clearly describe the procurement processes went through for the recruitment of the supervisors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Not observed any report prepared by the supervisors according to their day to day activities of the supervisory role of the cash for work laborers except on checking daily attendance sheet of the IDPs laborers undertaking cash for work activities.</td>
<td>SIDO should describe where are their attendance sheet and reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>I noticed that the finance person is not up to date on finance issues of the project which seems that he is not active on day to day financial tasks of the project</td>
<td>There is a need for further verification on the project finance related activities according to the budget breakdown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Referring to the community members and SIDO response, 20 - 30 families are using each toilet. However, how such this over usage of the toilet will improve the hygiene and sanitation of the IDP camp is uncertain as such this sanitation may create and stimulate very harmful and widespread diseases.</td>
<td>Recommended to increase the number of the toilets in order to reduce the sanitation risks that may come in the future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Remarkable findings that I noticed was not seen any approval and certification letters are not checked by UNDP Engineer for design, BOQ and completion of the kiosks, but SIDO internal Engineer took all those responsibilities accordingly.</td>
<td>Recommended to not release the payment of the constructions until UNDP Engineer will approve and certify that the construction is in line with design and BOQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>It was noted that there is no any UNDP staff who was observed/attended the procurement process of the construction materials, however, the transparency of the procurement of the construction materials is critical issue</td>
<td>The transparency of the procurement of processes of the construction materials is critical and need further explanation from SIDO why not involved UNDP to observe the whole processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Not seen in the docs checks the procurement processes of CfW tools and equipment at all, special attention to clean-up materials and equipment</td>
<td>PM should discuss further with SIDO and recommended UNDP to not release this fund unless otherwise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Assessment for work preparation reports and security of the IDP camp was not in place and thus, the cost incurred for this purpose is questionable</td>
<td>SIDO should refund the costs incurred for the work of the assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>The verification of the number of cash for work laborers is an issue</td>
<td>Third Party Monitors are involved the verification and the process started on last Thursday on 25 January, 2018 and therefore, it is recommended to not release the payment of the CfW laborers until the TPM verification report is submitted.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>