### PROMOTING CROSS-BORDER COOPERATION THROUGH EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT OF TAJIKISTAN'S BORDER WITH AFGHANISTAN

### **PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT**

April 2015 – December 2018

United Nations Development Programme Tajikistan

# FUNDED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF JAPAN THROUGH JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY (JICA) AND IMPELMETNED BY UNDP TAJIKISTAN



Empowered lives. Resilient nations.

**Project ID:** 00094530

**Project Duration**: 3 years 8 months (April 2015 – December 2018)

UNDP Key Result Area: Strengthening responsive governing institutions.

Total Budget: \$ 4,227,050.07

Donor funded: \$3,859,157.25

Regular (UNDP TRAC): \$ 300,000.00

Bank interest: \$ 67,892.82

**Implementing Partners/Responsible parties:** UNDP/Government of Tajikistan, including Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan, Tajik Border Troops of the State Committee of National Security of the Republic of Tajikistan, Customs Service under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan

## Contents

List of Abbreviations	2
I. General overview	3
Background:	3
Major achievements of the project:	3
Implementation period:	3
BMP Phase II:	4
Monitoring and Evaluation:	4
Report Purpose and Approach	4
II. Results summary and implementation review.	5
Summary of Project Outputs	5
1.1 Capacity building for border management and counter narcotics policy formulation, implementation and monitoring	5
1.2 Construction of Border Crossing Point Langar	5
1.3 Upgrade made of Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Langar, KKhumroghi and Shohon Border Crossing Points	
2.1 Upgrade of Cross-border Markets facilities	6
Additional Activities During No-Cost Extension	6
OUTCOME 1:	6
ACTIVITIES	7
<b>OUTCOME 2:</b>	5
ACTIVITIES:	6
III. Project Implementation Process and Management Arrangements	5
IV. Main Challenges and Lessons Learned	9
Annex A: Map of JICA-BMP1 Activity Sites	3
Annex B: National Border Management Strategy	5
Annex C: Communication materials/Press Release	5
Annex E: Project Financial Report	5

# List of Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKF	Aga Khan Foundation
ATV	All-Terrain Vehicle
BCP	Border Crossing Point
BG	Border Guards
BIG	Border International Group (Donor Coordination Mechanism)
BM	Border Management
BOMCA	Border Management Programme in Central Asia
BOMNAF	EU Border Management Northern Afghanistan Project
CBM	Cross-Border Market
DCA	Drug Control Agency under the President of the Republic of Tajikistan
DSA	Daily Subsistence Allowance
EU	European Union
FEZ	Free Economic Zone
GBAO	Gorno- Badakshan Autonomous Oblast
IBM	Integrated Border Management
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force
IOM	International Organization for Migration
HDI	Human Development Index
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
LITACA	Livelihoods Improvement in Tajik-Afghan cross-border areas
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
NBMS	National Border Management Strategy
NCNS	National Counter Narcotics Strategy
NV	Note Verbale (Formal Diplomatic Letter)
OSCE	Organization on Security and Cooperation in Europe
RFT	Request for Tenders
RT	Republic of Tajikistan
SCM	Steering Committee Meeting
SCNS	State Committee on National Security
TAPRI	Tajik Afghan Poverty Reduction Initiative
TBF	Tajikistan Border Force
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNODC	United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime
UNHCR	United Nations Higher Commissioner for Refugees
US	United States
USD	United States Dollar

### I. General overview

#### Background:

The "Promoting Cross-Border Cooperation through Effective Management of Tajikistan's Border with Afghanistan" project (BMP1) was initiated in April 2015, following stakeholder consultations and validation missions conducted by UNDP to the Gorno Badakhshan Autonomous Oblast. The project completed its work by December 30, 2018.

Effective border management has emerged as Tajikistan's priority, since the collapse of the Soviet Union created new international borders to manage. Tenuous stability in Afghanistan exposes Tajikistan to illicit drug trafficking that has undermined its stability. In this regard, Tajikistan faces risks posed from international terrorist and religious-extremist organizations, narcotics trafficking and weapons smuggling, and illegal migration.

Tajikistan shares 1,344 km of its border with Afghanistan. The Tajik-Afghan border has always been the most difficult section of the state border. The project contributed to the stability and security of the cross-border regions of Tajikistan and Afghanistan and assisted Tajik-Afghan border adjacent communities, in particular women, in pursuing cross-border trade that contributes towards stronger resilience and stability of the region.

As evidence suggests, the situation with gender equality and women's empowerment in Tajikistan and Afghanistan is worrisome indicating that women do not yet sufficiently benefit from the existing economic growth of the two countries. This perhaps allows forgoing opportunities to build cohesion and stability in the communities they live. Women living in rural and mountainous areas are more disadvantaged. Remoteness and inaccessibility of the communities such as those located along the Tajik and Afghan border further adds to vulnerability of women.

#### Major achievements of the project:

BMP enhanced existing capacities at both the policy and operational levels. On the policy level, the project supported the review and strengthening of the Border Management and Counter Narcotics strategies of the Government of Tajikistan. Comprehensive capacity building on an operational level included construction of a new BCP at Langar, construction of additional border and customs checking units at the Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs and provision of additional equipment for the BCPs at Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Langar, Khumroghi and Shohon. Improvements to Cross-Border Markets (CBMs) at Ruzvai and Ishkashim made significant positive changes for traders and border communities, generating new economic opportunities, particularly for women.

The project trained about 210 direct beneficiaries from the Interagency Secretariats for National Border Management Strategy and Counter-Narcotics Strategy, the Tajikistan Border Force and Tajikistan Customs Force. Participants demonstrated increased knowledge following trainings and also reported high satisfaction with the programme.

#### Implementation period:

Originally intended to run for 30 months through September 2017, the project received no-cost extensions until December 2018 due to construction delays caused by harsh weather, border security and logistical difficulties posed by high-altitude terrain and complex road networks. While no major security incidents directly impacted the project, there was a deterioration of the security

situation in Northern Afghanistan over the life of the project, which negatively affected trade between Tajikistan and Afghanistan, including the closure of the CBM at Ishkashim from 2015 until July 2019.

#### **BMP Phase II:**

In November 2018, a Grant Agreement for Phase II of the project was signed between the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan, JICA and UNDP, with the Government of Japan contributing \$4.6M. The goal of this project is to promote stability and security in the border areas of Tajikistan and Afghanistan, as well as to facilitate the improvement of the well-being of vulnerable groups.

#### Monitoring and Evaluation:

For quality assurance and timely implementation of field activities, joints field missions were conducted to the project sites, consisting of UNDP personnel, JICA and representatives from beneficiary agencies. As well as monitoring the progress of field activities, mission members were also observing the results of the project activities in improving living and working conditions of the border and customs officers in the field and traders at the cross-border markets. Findings from such field missions together with recommendations and next steps were documented in the form of Back to Office Report (BTOR) for future reference.

The projects training activities were evaluated by the participants at the end of each training course. The feedback from participants were presented in the form of a questionnaire, which were further summarized by project training team with the purpose to improve future training activities.

#### **Report Purpose and Approach**

This is the final project report for the "*Promoting Cross-Border Cooperation through Effective Management of Tajikistan's Border with Afghanistan*" project (BMP1), funded by the Government of Japan and UNDP. Implementing agencies were UNDP Tajikistan, in cooperation with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan, the Tajik Border Forces under the State Committee for National Security of the Republic of Tajikistan, the Customs Service under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan, Drug Control Agency under the President of the Republic of Tajikistan.

This report covers the duration of the project from its inception in April 2015 to its closure on December 30, 2018. Its purpose is to provide an overview of activities completed under the project, the manner in which the project was implemented and to generate recommendations and lessons learned for future border management programmes in Tajikistan. The report covers the project's progress made, including its activities, challenges faced and lessons learned.

The present report is the final report issued by the project, which previously submitted annual and semi-annual reports during the period 2015 - 2018.

#### **II. Results summary and implementation review**

The results chain of the project is as follows:

- IMPACT: Enhanced security and stability of cross border regions of Tajikistan and Afghanistan
- OUTPUT: Improved security and economic status of Tajik-Afghan border adjacent communities, especially women

#### **Summary of Project Outputs**

Planned Activity	Fina	l Status
1.1 Capacity building for border management and counter narcotics po	olicy	formulation,
implementation and monitoring		
1.1.1 Review of Border Management strategy	•	Complete.
1.1.2 Counter Narcotics Strategy	•	Complete.
1.1.3 Technical support to Interagency Secretariat on implementation and monitoring of the National Border Management and Counter-Narcotics Strategy	•	Complete.
1.2 Construction of Border Crossing Point Langar		
1.2.1 Project design and layout works	•	Complete.
1.2.2 Construction of the main building	• (	Complete.
1.2.3 Power supply	•	Complete.
1.2.4 Water supply	•	Complete.
1.3 Upgrade made of Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Langar, KKhumroghi and Shohon Borc	ler Cro	ossing Points
1.3.1 Construct additional check-in desks/counters (6 each in Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs)	•	Complete.
1.3.2 Construct additional inspection units for women (1 each in Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs)	•	Complete.
<ul> <li>1.3.3 Provision of equipment for 6 BPCs (for border guards):</li> <li>36 computer sets, including printers, scanners and copy machines</li> <li>36 Document ID and control equipment</li> <li>48 CCTV</li> <li>6 air conditioners</li> <li>6 oil heaters</li> <li>3 power generators (Khumroghi, Shohon and Langar BCPs)</li> </ul>	•	Complete.
<ul> <li>1.3.4 Provision of equipment for 6 BCPs (for customs):</li> <li>18 computer sets, including printers, scanners and copy machines</li> <li>15 Customs control and rummage kits</li> <li>6 air conditioners</li> <li>6 oil heaters</li> <li>18 CCTV</li> <li>3 power generators (Khumroghi, Shohon and Langar BCPs)</li> </ul>	•	Complete.
1.3.5 Provision of furniture for 6 BCPs (for border guards and customs)	•	Complete.

1.3.6 Training on enhanced border and customs control for border guards and customs control staff, including training of female officers on procedures for searching females crossing the border	• Complete.
2.1 Upgrade of Cross-border Markets facilities	
2.1.1 Complete roofing of 2 cross border markets in Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs	• Complete.
2.1.2 Construct sales points for 2 cross border markets	Complete.
2.1.3 Construct storage facilities for traders	Complete.
2.1.4 Construct 2 canteens for 50 people	Complete.
2.1.5 Improve hygiene and sanitation facilities:	
• Construct latrines for women and men	• Complete.
• Construct shower units for women and men	
2.1.6 Improve existing water supply facilities in 2 cross border markets	Complete.
2.1.7 Install CCTV in the markets to be connected to the BCPs at Ruzvai, Ishkashim and Tem BCPs	• Complete.
Additional Activities During No-Cost Extension	
• BCP Shohon. Installation of containerized building.	• Complete.
• BCP Khumroghi. Installation of containerized building.	Complete.
• BCP Langar. Provision of water supply at adjacent barracks.	Complete.
• BCP Tem. Construction of perimeter wall and improvement of lighting system.	• Complete.

BMP1 created more favourable conditions for effective management of Tajikistan's border with Afghanistan, including modernization of border checkpoints.

The project included construction of a new BCP at Langar and upgrading of 5 (Shohon, Khumroghi, Tem, Ruzvai, Iskashim) existing BCPs through construction of additional border and customs checking units where required and provision of equipment and furniture. The project made improvements to cross-border markets (renovation in Ishkashim and Ruzvai) and provided training to improve the capacity of border security officers. The project upgraded the facilities of the two existing cross-border markets at Ruzvai and Ishkashim. The proposed interventions included construction of additional roofing and sales points for traders, adequate hygiene and sanitation facilities and canteens as well as building secure storage space for traders to reduce their cost of operations. To enhance the security within the market, security cameras installed and connected to the BCPs Ruzvai and Ishkashim.

#### **OUTCOME 1:**

# Increased capacity of Border Security Agencies for legal flow of people and goods across the Tajik - Afghan border

To increase capacity of Border Security Agencies for legal flow of people and goods across the Tajik and Afghan border, the existing National Border Management Strategy and Counter-Narcotics Strategy were reviewed and adjusted to better meet the current development context. In addition, a coherent and comprehensive implementation and costing plans were developed to ensure close monitoring of implementation process. Furthermore, the capacity of the Interagency

Secretariats was strengthened for more coordinated approach towards strategy implementation and monitoring, including resource mobilization from state and non-state actors. UNDP's support in this regard was of a facilitating nature, while the actual work was carried out by the Interagency Secretariats and strictly in line with established rules and procedures for revising and adjusting high level documents such as National Strategies on Border Management and Counter-Narcotics. The training to Interagency Secretariats mainly focused on leadership skills, including on effective negotiations, fundraising, donor coordination, communication, and monitoring of the strategy implementation. The study tours to the United Kingdom and Georgia was complementing the training activity and helped the members of the Interagency Secretariats to better understand the key challenges in planning, formulating and implementing border related strategies and reforms.

While constructing and upgrading target BCPs special consideration was given to facilitate women's border crossing. Construction of separate inspection units for women have adequate facilities for Customs Inspector (female) to search female traders according to prevailing rules and procedures. This measure is also in line with the provision of the National Border Management Strategy which aims to *'institute an internal regulation forbidding the searching of females by male officers'*. Thus, by introducing appropriate checking facilities, the project contributed to meeting the strategic objectives of the Government and at the same time helped to reducing the volume of drug smuggling and other types of illegal movement of goods and people through the borders.

#### ACTIVITIES

# 1.1 Capacity building for border management and counter narcotics policy formulation, implementation and monitoring

UNDP funded the review and revision of the National Border Management Strategy and the National Counter-Narcotics Strategy. These Strategies represented important steps taken by the Government of Tajikistan to ensure border security, but due to resource constraints, implementation was very slow. Updates to these Strategies and provided support in their implementation strengthened the sustainability of border management and counter-narcotics measures by promoting principles of integrated border management (IBM) and complementing security sector measures with economic and social measures.

# 1.1.1 Review and update National Border Management Strategy (2010-2025), including its action and costing plans

UNDP, OSCE and IOM signed a Memorandum of Understanding to jointly implement a review of the National Border Management Strategy (NBMS). BMP1 contracted an international expert who reviewed the NBMS in cooperation with an expert from the OSCE. The recommendations were completed by 7 July 2016 and submitted to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan.

Following this review, and in order to strengthen integrated border management, on 12 September 2017, representatives from 16 government agencies participated in the official opening of the Inter-

Agency Secretariat for Border Management and Security of Tajikistan. At the event, the evaluation report of the short-term implementation (2010-2015) of the National Border Management Strategy of Tajikistan were handed over to the Tajik authorities, which the BMP1-JICA conducted in 2016 with the OSCE Programme Office in Dushanbe and the International Organization for Migration.

The creation of this Inter-Agency Secretariat provided a long-term, sustainable means of organizing work between government bodies responsible for implementation of the NBMS, ensuring better accountability and cooperation between agencies. It is anticipated that this increased mechanism for communication between agencies will speed up implementation of the NBMS.

#### **Target Indicators**

- Implementation status of the National Strategy on Border Management and National Strategy on Drug Abuse;
- Number of people (gender segregated) crossing the border per week, including on the market days (gender segregated)
- Number of illegal crossings prevented

# 1.1.2 Review and update National Counter-Narcotics Strategy 2014-2020, including its action and costing plans.

On the request of the Drug Control Agency and in order to improve implementation of the NCNS 2014-2020, the Implementation plan were reviewed by a local expert. Revised and updated Implementation plan was handed over to the the National Counter Narcotics Strategy Secretariat on 31 July 2017.

#### 1.1.3 Technical support to Interagency Secretariat on strategy implementation and monitoring

UNDP provided technical support to the National Border Management Strategy Secretariat and the National Counter Narcotics Strategy Secretariat according to the project plan. The Drug Control Agency provided a list of required equipment and furniture for the National Counter Narcotics Strategy Secretariat, which was procured and supplied by the project.

In addition, training and study tours were conducted for both the National Border Management Strategy Secretariat and the National Counter Narcotics Strategy Secretariat. Trainings for 15 members of these Secretariats were held in Dushanbe from 2 to 6 October 2017. Participants gained skills and knowledge in leadership, effective negotiation, fundraising, donor coordination, communication and monitoring of national strategy implementation.

To reinforce knowledge gained during the training, study tours for members of the Interagency Secretariats were conducted so they could better understand the key challenges in planning, formulating and implementing border related strategies and reforms. From 25 September to 1 October 2016, a delegation consisting of six members of the two Interagency National Border Management and Counter-Narcotics Strategy Secretariats undertook a study visit to the UK.

Participants gained an improved understanding of good practices in Counter Narcotics, Border Management and customs procedures from British practitioners and border agencies.

Facilitator's report and feedback from the participants stated that the tour was well organized. The benefit gained by those participants who engaged positively was significant. However, it was noted that the knowledge and awareness the delegates gained during the visit will require persistent follow up if it is to be sustained and positive change achieved.



From 16 to 21 October 2017, a delegation consisting of six members of the two Interagency National Border Management and Counter-Narcotics Strategy Secretariats undertook a study visit to the Georgia. Participants gained an improved understanding of good practices in Counter Narcotics, Border Management and customs procedures from Georgian practitioners and border agencies. As with the first study tour, participants and the Facilitator gave the trip high marks for both content and organization.

#### 1.2 Construction of Border Crossing Point (BCP) Langar

Construction of the BCP Langar began on November 7, 2016 and was planned to be completed in 11 months, by the end of October 2017. Since the BCP Langar is located at high altitude in mountainous area with severe weather and difficult road conditions, the timely delivery of construction materials was a challenging task. Harsh weather conditions on the Tajik-Afghan border didn't allow construction works to be implemented smoothly during wintertime.

Langar proved to be the most challenging project site, in particular because of its remote location and severe weather conditions during the winter of 2016-18 when high snowfall increased the prevalence of avalanches, rock falls and landslides in the project area. Due to winter and harsh weather, border security, altitude (2,909m), mountainous terrain and difficult and dangerous road networks, it has been impossible to complete the construction of BCP Langar, in the Wakhan Corridor, by the originally planned end date of the project. In this regard, the contract with the construction company for the construction of the BCP Langar was extended to end May 2018.

The project conducted extensive work at BCP Langar, creating a modern and functioning BCP at a challenging site that had previously been assessed at having "no capacity," due to its inadequate facilities, lack of water and electricity and poorly trained staff.

Despite the numerous logistical challenges presented by the site's geography, BCP Langar was completed in 2018, including provision of water, electricity and accommodation facilities for staff. New equipment and furniture were provided and installed.

On 25 October 2018 UNDP handed over the New BCP Langar to the Tajik Border Forces and Customs Services in Ishkashim district, Gorno-Badakhshan Autonomous Region (GBAO). A



Tajik governmental and Japanese officials signed the hand-over documents for BCP Langar.

Certificate of Completion was signed by representatives of the State Commission and was approved by the Commander of the Tajik Border Force. On October 25, a hand-over ceremony of the Border-crossing point (BCP) "Langar" to Tajik Border Forces and Customs Services took place in Ishkashim district, Gorno-Badakhshan Autonomous Region (GBAO). Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of Japan to Tajikistan, Mr. Hajime Kitaoka, General Mr. Rajabali Rahmonali, Head of Tajik Border Forces, General Izatullo Hurmatzoda, Deputy Head of Tajikistan Customs Service, and Mr. Ken Inoue, Senior Representative of JICA Tajikistan Office took part at the event. Addressing the ceremony high level representatives stressed the importance of security and stability that is to be promoted through enhanced infrastructure and capacity building of officers working in border-crossing points, as well as livelihoods of the people living in bordering areas. *1.3 Upgrade of Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Langar, Khumroghi and Shohon Border Crossing Points* 

Upgrades were made to the Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Langar, Khumroghi and Shohon BCPs. All BCPs had different levels of capacity at the start of the project and different access to resources

through other grant mechanisms, but these sites were selected through field missions and consultations with the Government of Tajikistan because they were the most threatened by drug smuggling. Following upgrades, all BCPs are fully operational, meeting necessary standards for supporting IBM.

In order to support much heavier traffic to CBMs at the Ruzvai, Tem and Ishkashim BCPs, which had been built and equipped by the EU funded Border Management Programme in Central Asia in 2005-2006, a total of 18 new border and customs check-in desks (6 at each site), additional furniture and equipment were provided. By providing this infrastructure, BMP1 greatly increased the speed of traders' flow to cross the border to attend CBMs. For example, as project observation shows at Tem BCPby increasing the number of checking desks from 2 to 5, transit time for traders to the Tem cross-border market was decreased from 3 hours to just over 1 hour. This in turn increased the number of hours that traders can potentially spend at the market, which was previously only about 3 hours, and makes it easier for women traders to travel back before dark.

At Shohon and Khumroghi BCPs, which had been established by the Aga Khan Foundation, BMP1 provided customs checking equipment, and separate checking facilities for women.

In upgrading BCPs, special consideration was given to better facilitating women's border crossing. Separate inspection units for women were built, which included facilities for female Customs Inspectors to search female traders. This measure was in line with the provision of the National Border Management Strategy to *'institute an internal regulation forbidding the searching of females by male officers'*. Thus, conditions were created to increase the number of women crossing the border, while also ensuring that proper inspections can be conducted, contributing to reducing the volume of drug smuggling and other illegal movement of goods and people through the borders.

At the request of the Government of Tajikistan, some rehabilitation and refurbishment activities were undertaken in Tem, Shohon and Khumroghi BCPs. : At Tem, a perimeter wall was constructed around the BCP and an improved lighting system was added; at BCPs Shohon and Khumroghi containerized buildings were installed; and at Langar a water supply was connected to the adjacent barracks.

Promoting Cross-Border Cooperation through Effective Management of Tajikistan's Border with Afghanistan Final Report

# 1.3.2 Additional inspection units for women were provided to the Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs.

Inspection units for women were established at the 3 project sites that are adjacent to CBMs. The completion of these units for women already appears to be significantly increasing traffic of women through border zones; for example, in Tem, 40% of those crossing are now female, compared with the average of 1-2% at all BCPs before the project began. As women are primarily employed in the agricultural sector and in small-scale trading, the new ability to cross the border in a culturallyappropriate way provides significant



opportunities for economic advancement. These improvements also support the Government of Tajikistan in implementing its National Border Management Strategy, which calls for institution of "an internal regulation forbidding of searching of females by male officers."

#### 1.3.3 Provision of border guards' equipment for six BCPs

Furniture and equipment were delivered to all six BCPs (Tem, Ruzvai, Shohon, Khumroghi, Ishkashim and Langar). Some equipment originally slated for purchase was provided by IOM and other donors, including passport readers and other items of technical equipment to border agencies.

By the conclusion of the project, all BCPs were equipped with:

- Computer sets including printers, scanners and copy machines;
- Control equipment;
- Closed Circuit Television Camera (CCTV);
- Six metal detector arches;
- Air conditioners;
- Oil heaters.

Other furniture and equipment for border guards was procured in accordance with requests received from beneficiaries. These included office equipment and furniture, furniture for accommodation, kitchen equipment, tool sets and binoculars for six BCPs. Furniture was presented to border guards on a rolling basis as received.

CCTV and X-Ray scanners were provided to all 6 BCPs, following a feasibility study and open tender. The successful use of this equipment will depend on ongoing training and maintenance, which should be considered during implementation of BMP2.

#### Promoting Cross-Border Cooperation through Effective Management of Tajikistan's Border with Afghanistan Final Report

Three power generators were also provided by the project for Khumroghi, Shohon and Langar BCPs.



X-Ray scanner installed at BCP



Hand-over of equipment at BCP Tem

#### 1.3.4 Provision of customs equipment for six BCPs

Furniture and equipment were handed over to the Tajik Customs Service personnel at all 6 BCPs. X-Ray scanners were installed at the Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Khumroghi, Shohon and Langar BCPs.

#### 1.3.5 Furniture was provided to 6 BCPs for border guards and customs

List of equipment and furniture provided to beneficiaries is Annexed to this report

# 1.3.6 Training on enhanced border and customs control for border guards and customs control staff, including training of female officers on procedures for searching females, who cross the border.

Training was provided to border and customs officials on Integrated Border Management concepts that require intra-service, interagency and international cooperation for a more comprehensive, effective and efficient system of border management in the country.

Topics for training were determined in partnership with beneficiary agencies. Project monitoring found that participants increased their knowledge, including technical capacity and ability to use equipment.

Trainings delivered by BMP on various topics aimed at the improvement of practical skills of officers and the presentation of modern IBM techniques and methods. Since 2016 the project has regularly facilitated and supported Border Management Awareness courses for mid-level and senior officers from the Afghan Border Police (ABP) and Tajik Border Force. The objective of this course was to provide an opportunity for mid-level and senior officers of the Tajik Border Force, Tajik Customs Service and Drug Control Agency to receive high-quality training which supports the Integrated Border Management (IBM) concept. The project aimed to deliver high-quality training which supports the IBM concept and focuses on the most essential skills Central and South Asian border officials need to learn. Integration of the skills learned or improved during the courses increased the effectiveness of the TBF, TCS and DCA staff.

The BMA course bring together important elements of border security management and helpedstudents understand international standards, use modern methods and technologies to prevent transnational crime. Among the topics taught were: management and control of borders; risk analysis models; intelligence information analysis; detection of fraudulent documents and impostors; anti-corruption techniques; combatting trafficking in humans, drugs, and weapons; preventing money laundering; leadership and management techniques; gender and human rights issues.

Majority of BMP trainings were conducted at the OSCE Border Management Staff College (BMSC) given the availability of required facilities and experts.

To ensure cross-border cooperation and collaboration between the border agencies of Tajikistan with the Afghan Border Police (ABP) officers from Afghanistan, BMP closely cooperated with the BOMNAF project in conducting joint training courses. Associated costs for participants from Tajikistan was covered by BMP and costs for Afghan participants was covered by BOMNAF projects

Course Title	Project	Training Dates	No of Participants	Location	Remarks
Train the	BOMNAF/B	14 - 18 Feb	8 x ABP	BMSC	1 female TBF
Trainer (T3)	MP	2016	2 x TBF	Dushanbe	student; 1
					female ABP
					student.
Border	BOMNAF/B	29 Feb - 10	17 x ABP; 2 x	BMSC	
Management	MP	Mar 2016	DCA; 2 x TBF	Dushanbe	
Awareness					
(BMA)					
BMA	BOMNAF/B	9 - 19 May	18 x ABP; 5 x	BMSC	All females (23)
(Women)	MP	2016	TBF	Dushanbe	
BMA	BOMNAF/B	18 - 28 Jul	20 x ABP; 2 x	BMSC	
	MP	2016	TBF	Dushanbe	
BMA	BMP	25 - 29 Apr	10 x TBF; 5 x	BMSC	1 female DCA
		2016	TCS; 5 x DCA	Dushanbe	Student

The table below show	s training in sp	pecific training	provided is shown below:	
	~ <del>8</del> ~ <b>r</b>		<b>I</b>	

BMA	BMP	23 - 27 May 2016	10 x TBF; 5 x TCS; 5 x DCA	BMSC Dushanbe	1 female DCA Student
BMA	BMP	26 - 30 Sep	9 x TBF; 5 x	BMSC	1 female DCA
		2016	TCS; 5 x DCA	Dushanbe	Student
Polaris ATV	BMP	25 Apr - 5	18 x TBF	Dushanbe	
Maint & Op		May 2016			
Trg		-			
Disaster Risk	BOMNAF/B	30 May - 3	30 x ABP; 15	Tem/Shegnan	
Management 2	MP	Jun 2016	TBF	BCP	
Secretariat	BMP	15 - 19 Sep	18 x Secretariat	Dushanbe	
Training		2016	members		
Secretariat	BMP	26 - 30 Sep	6 x Secretariat	United	
Study Tour		2016	members	Kingdom	
BMA	BMP	12 -16 June	10 x TBF; 10 x	Dushanbe	
		2017	TCS;		
Disaster Risk	BMP	21-25 June	10 x TBF; 10 x	Tem/Shegnan	
Management		2017	TCS;	C C	
Border	BMP	03-13 July	10x TBF; 10 x	Dushanbe	
Management		2017	TCS;		
Awareness					
Secretariat	BMP	02-	15 Secretariat	Dushanbe	
Training		06 October	members		
e		2017			
Secretariat	BMP	16-21	6 Secretariat	Georgia	
Study Tour		October 2017	members	Ũ	
Total Trained			210 (only BMP		
			beneficiaries)		



Inspecting contraband goods during study tour in London

#### **OUTCOME 2:**

Improved livelihoods of border adjacent communities, especially women to trade opportunities

To improve the livelihoods of border adjacent communities, including through women's opportunities to engage in commercial trade, the project upgraded the two cross-border market facilities in Ruzvai and Ishkashim. These markets were designed with little concern for the specific needs of women traders and women visitors as well as the needs of small traders to minimize the cost of their operation. Therefore, the facilities of the two cross-border markets at Ruzvai and Ishkashim upgraded, especially to promote economic activities of women traders.

#### **ACTIVITIES:**

#### 2.1 Upgrade of Cross-border Market Facilities

The project contributed to significant improvements at the Cross-Border Markets (CBMs) at Ruzvai and Ishkashim BCPs, which had previously been operating with little regard for the needs of women traders and were also not optimized to reduce costs to small-scale traders, for whom transportation and storage were major concerns.

Storage facilities were added, reducing the amount of travel that is required for traders and their cost of trading at the CBMs. Hygiene and sanitation facilities were improved, which included building latrines for both women and men and improving the existing water supply facilities at both markets. Concrete paving was added. A canteen for 50 people and additional sales points were constructed at Ishkashim. To improve security, CCTV security cameras were installed and connected to the BCPs at Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim. Roofs were not constructed at Ruzvai CBM as planned, because the existing structures were assessed to be in adequate condition.

Major improvements to the Cross-Border markets at Ishkashim and Ruzvai, as well as investments in training and infrastructure at other BCPs has resulted in increased trade, better conditions at markets and an increase in women traders. For example, at the Tem CBM, there are now 700-3,000 traders each Saturday, of which 40% are women. Well-equipped sales points and storage areas have made it easier for traders to get to the BCM, particularly in winter months. The canteens serve large numbers of traders and also serve as hubs for members of border communities to gather, converse and have a meal or buy food to take home. It is also reported that the use of CCTV has been one of the best means of improving security at markets.

However, deterioration of the security situation in Northern Afghanistan over several years has negatively affected trade between Afghanistan and Tajikistan. As a result, cross-border markets in Ishkashim, Shohon and Khumrogi, which are the target areas for this project, have remained closed since July 2015. Beneficiary representatives assure that closure of cross border markets (so far more than one year) is a temporary measure and they will reopen as the security situation improves.

#### **III. Project Implementation Process and Management Arrangements** <u>*Cooperation with BOMNAF:*</u>

BMP worked closely with the EU funded Border Management in Afghanistan, Phase II (BOMNAF II), also implemented by UNDP, and the two shared an International Project Manager. This consolidated management arrangement did not change the project activities of either but did allow for synergies between projects, improved coordination and improved quality of deliverables, in line with core principles of integrated border management. The recommendation to change the

management structure and invite an international Chief Technical Adviser (CTA) who would serve on both the BOMNAF II and BMP1 projects was made by UNDP Tajikistan after initiating recruitment for key staff positions, and in light of increased security threats in the region from ISIL and other actors.

The specific complementar	ities of the BOMNAF II	I and BMP1 projects are as follows	;:
		F J	

	BOMNAF II activities		BM Project activities
Cons	struction:		
1.	Construction of a Border Crossing Point in Khohon district, Badakshan Province	1.	Build new Border Crossing Point (BCP) in Langar,
2.	Construction of Border Outposts on the Afghan- Turkmen and Afghan-Uzbek border (locations to be confirmed)	2.	Upgrade BCP infrastructure in Tem, Ruzvai and Ishkashim,
<ol> <li>Construction of a Training Center in Mazar-e- Sharif, Balkh Province</li> </ol>			Provide equipment and furniture to BCPs Langar, Tem, Ruzvai, Ishkashim, Shohon and Khumroghi;
Cros	s border trade:		
1	. Create cross-border markets to improve legitimate trade and exchange;	1.	Upgrade cross-border market facilities in Ruzvai and Ishkashim.
Conf	erences, training and awareness raising:		
2	. Capacity building measures (educational, training & mentoring activities) for Afghan Border Police officers;	2.	Training on integrated border management for border and customs officials;
3	. Raise awareness of borderland communities on border security, cross-border trade and disaster risk preparedness.		
4	. Organize and conduct events, workshops, seminars and conferences on Border Management to promote cross-border cooperation and collaboration;		

The project was conducted using principles of integrated border management (IBM), such that UNDP served as Secretariat for the Border International Working Group to ensure direct linkages between the policy-level support and operational-level technical assistance at BCPs.

Funding from JICA for BMP to strengthen the border in Tajikistan was critical in complementing EU funding for BOMNAF on the Afghanistan side of the border. Both donors allowed a degree of flexibility to ensure that capacities are built in parallel on both sides of the border, and border-related security and development challenges are viewed by border officials as a common challenge, requiring actions from both sides of the border. BCP Dehqonkhona is constructed on the Afghanistan side of the border, which will ensure functionality of BCP Langar on the Tajik side of the border. The same applies to BCP Ishkashim in Tajikistan and BCP Eshkashem on the Afghanistan side as well as to BCP Shohon (Tajikistan) and Khohon (Afghanistan). For greater interactions and discussions of common challenges and opportunities presented by the common border, UNDP also provided joint training of border and customs officials from both Tajikistan and Afghanistan.

### **IV. Main Challenges and Lessons Learned**

#### Building on challenges and lessons from BMP:

Security and stability of the region are among the top priorities for the Tajik government. In this context, Tajikistan pays great importance to effective border management. Special attention is paid to the border with Afghanistan, due to the unstable situation in that country. Experience has shown that border management achieves the best results if (a) interventions are supported by favorable conditions and an enabling environment for cross-border cooperation, and (b) opportunities are created for legal employment and self-employment of cross border communities.

#### Further capacity building at BCPs:

Successful implementation of BMP1 I, including strengthening the capacity of the Tajik Border Force provides a solid basis for continuing efforts already initiated.

Tajikistan's BCPs lack modern technical equipment for screening and quick transit, especially at those sections of the border where there is a large traffic flow. According to the President of Tajikistan, it is necessary to build approximately twelve new frontier posts on the Tajik-Afghan border and to renovate and refurbish more than 100 outposts, that were built in the 30-40s of the last century. Under BMP1, the six target BCPs have received specialised equipment. Experience shows that the equipment and furniture received under BMP1 were sufficient to address immediate needs of target BCPs. Future capacity building efforts need to focus on maintenance of specialised equipment and additional needs not addressed under BMP1.

For example, BMP1 frequently sent a specialist team to several BCPs to repair CC TV, as there were no specialists on the ground. This will require future planning to ensure that equipment is properly maintained and used. Despite denial by HQ TBF, there remains a need for training and user-friendly manuals to improve skills to operate donated equipment. Training on using equipment such as X-Ray scanners and CC TV cameras will need to be updated continuously, as there is a new staff rotation every 6 months.

#### Greater focus on cross border trade:

The key lesson is that both BMP1 and BOMNAF are heavily focused on security aspects of border management, including provision of essential skills and equipment for day-to-day operations at BCPs. BMP1 also included funding for more effective operations of CBMs. Lessons learnt from UNDP's past border management interventions, including from BMP11, suggest that, to encourage regional economic integration, any new phase of BMP1 should have a greater focus on modernization, regional cooperation, trade facilitation and cross-border activities. Therefore, more investment is required to develop the local economic potential of border adjacent communities through boosting cross-border trade and developing the potential of a Free Economic Zone at Ishkashim. This in turn requires synergies with the JICA funded LITACA project.

#### <u>Coordination – Agencies:</u>

As during BMP1 to maintain the avoidance of duplication by other agencies, Interagency coordination through the Borders Implementation Group (BIG) should be a continuing focus.

#### Broaden the perception of BCP's mandate to go beyond security aspects of border management:

Without broad international cooperation, Tajikistan will not be able to achieve its goals in development of the national economy and relations with neighboring countries. Border Crossing Points are an important mechanism for the development of Tajikistan's fiscal planning; they are not only a security mechanism, but also an instrument for cross-border trade and regional development.

#### Cross-Border Markets:

Six bridges and border crossing points, incorporating cross-border markets are very important for providing the population of borderlands regions, especially in Badakhshan province, with goods and trading opportunities.

#### Security on the Tajik-Afghan Border:

A fragile and unstable security situation in the neighbouring provinces of Afghanistan continues to alert Tajikistan to tighten security on its southern borders. A 2016 International Crisis Group (ICG) report stated that border security, despite investments and technical assistance from Japan, Russia, the EU and USA, is at best haphazard, partly because of the mountainous terrain but also because the narcotics trade. Border weaknesses increase Tajikistan's potential as a staging post for Islamic militants with ambitions elsewhere in Central Asia.

The same report goes on to state that the Tajik-Afghan border is the weakest link in Central Asia's security. International aid to bolster border security and counter drug trafficking has not been adequately coordinated and has had limited impact.

The project closely monitored the security situation, both directly and through UNDSS, and maintained risk mitigation plans at the construction sites. Fortunately, there were no major security threats to the project sites. The security environment forced the closure of the Ishkashim Cross-Border Market during the life of the project, but fortunately had stabilized enough for the market to be opened in July 2019.

#### **Other Challenges:**

Border crossing points are not only to prevent illegal drug trafficking and illegal crossing of the state border, but are also considered as a component for creating possibilities for greater economic cooperation through cross-border markets. If the border is equipped with modern equipment, border outposts repaired and border guards professionally trained, peace and stability in the countries of Central Asia will be supported. Before this can happen, key challenges to cross-border markets include governance, infrastructure and coordination.

Another challenge was receiving timely input from beneficiary agencies. For example, On 9 June 2016 Beneficiary agency focal points were requested to provide requirements for furniture, IT

Equipment and other equipment. After several reminders and repeat requests, these were eventually provided and confirmed through MFA on:

Customs	– July 2016
Border Force	– 11 August 2016
NSCN Secretariat (DCA)	- 3 November 2016
NBMS Secretariat	– Mid 2017

Although beneficiaries several times changed requested lists of equipment and furniture, no specifications were provided.

Governance: Markets are operated and administered by District governments, who also provide local services to each CBM location. Legal operationalization of cross-border markets has been complicated by insufficient human and technical capacity within agencies charged with facilitating flows of goods and people. Notable issues include: limited hours, inferior quality of goods, dissatisfaction with hygiene at some locations, disputes between traders, corruption of regulations, and delays in establishing new cross-border markets. BMP1 II could provide and support links from District to National Government structures. This may be done through the creation of a new Technical Working Group (TWG). Alternatively, the feasibility of using the existing platforms such as regional Consultative Councils on Investment Climate will also be explored.

Infrastructure: Several international organizations have contributed to infrastructure improvements in cross-border markets and surrounding areas. Roads, bridges and markets have been built and rehabilitated to improve access. Additional needs include developing road infrastructure, electricity, clean water supplies, shelter and warehouses.

Coordination: Traders and consumers using cross-border markets are growing without a commensurate increase in support for creating an environment conducive to expanding trade activities. As markets mature and traders familiarity with regulations increases, local and international organizations should coordinate economic development activities to avoid duplication and ensure effectiveness.

#### **Management Arrangements:**

The project implemented by UNDP under its Direct Implementation Modality (DIM) whereby UNDP takes on the role of Implementing Partner.

According to the Programme and Operational Policies and Procedures of UNDP, the following Policies are applied for Direct Implementation Modality:

All Policies and Procedures applicable to UNDP operations (i.e. procurement of goods and services, recruitment of project personnel, training activities, etc).

The Project Board comprising the Embassy of Japan in the Republic of Tajikistan, JICA in the Republic of Tajikistan, UNDP in Tajikistan and the Government of Tajikistan formed to provide strategic direction of the project. The Project Board reviewed the progress of the project, including project reports, and work plans. The Project Board served as a platform for the major stakeholders

of the project to discuss the overall direction of the project as well as to take the strategic decisions to ensure most optimal use of resources towards achievement of set goals and objectives.

Project Board meetings organized on regular basis, but not less than twice a year, to review workplans and implementation of the project.



#### **Communications and Changes to Project Plans:**

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Tajikistan made several requests for changes to the project plan, which represented major deviations from the agreed upon project. These included a request for a secure communications system for all of GBAO that would have cost \$11 million USD. H.E. Amb. Kamada Takashi responded at the 9 June 2016 Steering Committee Meeting (SCM) that the Government of Japan only agreed to approve new work following the completion of all planned activities and a review of remaining funds. However, a further request was also made at the SCM on 20 December 2016 that future trainings and study tour, scheduled and planned for 2017, should be cancelled and any resulting funds saved should be re-programmed to renovation of an unspecified building, to be used as the NBMS Secretariat offices. This request was declined, as it had not been preceded by appropriate consultation with all parties and reiteration that additional activities would only be considered following successful completion of all agreed upon activities.



#### Annex A: Map of JICA-BMP1 Activity Sites

### Annex B: LIST OF EQUIPMENT AND FURNITURE PROVIDED BY BMP

List of furniture

	BCP Ruzvai BCP Tem BCP Ishkashim BCP Langar BCP Shogun BCP Hur								Humrogi	Payndj				
#	Description	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TBF
1	Conferencing tables/set		4		4		6		6	0	2		2	5
2	Conferencing chairs		40		40		60		74		20		20	40
3	Office armchairs on rollers	6	5	2	6	3	7	6	30		7	2	5	
4	Office Tables without drawers	2	10	2	10	2	15	5	30	2	5	2	5	
5	Chairs	4	6	5	14	4	26	19	80	4	6	4	6	50
6	Dining Tables for 6 persons with 6 chairs		5		5		5	1	50		5		5	6
7	Office Tables with 3 drawers on one-side	3	3	1	3	2	3	5	14	2	3	2	3	
8	Office Tables with 3 drawers on two-side		2		2		2		7		2		2	
9	Book shelfs/Wardrobe	2	2	2	2	1	5	6	30		2	2	2	12
10	Storage cabinet	1	2	1	2	1	2	4	14	1	2	1	2	6
11	Office safe		1		1		1	1	4		1		1	
12	Military bunk bed		0		5	2	0	6	33	2	0	2	5	18
13	Single bed (wooden)		2	2	5		5	6	22		2	2	2	
14	Bedside table, with drawer		2	2	15		5		88		2	4	12	
15	Sofa		1		1		1		3				0	
	Mirror		1		1		1		5		1		1	
	Hangers for clothes		2		2		2		5		2		2	
18	Plastic barrel		2		2		2		3		2		2	

	List of equipment												
#	Description	BCP R		BCP		BCP Ishkasł		angar	BCP Sho			lumrogi	
		TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF	TCS	TBF
1	Tool with bit driver	5	8	3	5	5	11	6	25	2	8	2	5
2	Hand-held torch with rechargeable batteries and charger	2	10	2	10	2	10	8	15	4	10	2	10
3	Binocular		1		1		1	2	3		1		1
4	Binocular		3		3		3	2	3		3		3
5	Automatic Voltage Regulator (Stabilizer) 5000VA	2	3	3	3	2	3	3	9	2	2	2	2
6	TV-set	1	2	1	2	1	2	2	7	1	2	1	1
7	Gas Oven		1		1		2	2	6		1		1
8	Gas Cylinder		1		2		2	10	14		1		2
9	Electric cooktop with oven		1		1		1	3	4		1		1
10	Fridge	1	1	1	1	1	1	4	4		1		1
11	Washing machine		1		2		2	1	4		1		1
12	Kitchen sets		3		3		3	4	7		3		3
13	Endoscope for customs purposes	1		1		1		1		1		1	
14	Electric oilfilled heater	4	10	2	10	3	10	5	16		10		10
15	Pick	4	4	4	4	4	4	8	20		4		4
16	Shovel	4	4	4	4	4	4	8	20		4		4
17	Felling Axe	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	8		4		4
18	Hand saw	3	4	3	4	3	4		13		4		4
19	Tool-set	1	5	1	5	1	5	2	5	4	5		2
20	Notebook	3		3		3		3	7	3		3	
21	Flash Drive Kingston 64 GB	2	2	2	2	2	2	10	10	2	2	2	2
22	External Hard Drive 2TB	1	1	1	1	1	1	5	5	1	1	1	1
23	Cartridje	3	3	3	6	3	6	3	12		3		3
24	Printer HP M225 Laser Jet Pro All in one CF485AB19	1	1	1	2	1	2	1	4		1		1
25	Satellite TV-receiver with antenna and head	1	2	1	2	1	2	2	7	1	2	1	1
	Fire extinguisher board set		2		2		2		12		2		2
	Accumulator		1		1		1		2		1		1
	Air-conditioner		3		1		3	5	10		3		2
	Water heater		1		1		1	1	2		1		1
30	All Terrain Quadbikes Polaris								2				

List of equipment

Fluctuation

## Annex E: Project Financial Report

Please refer to separately provided Excel Spreadsheet