

## MINUTES

### of the Local Project Appraisal Committee (LPAC) meeting for

### The UNDP-GEF Full-Sized Project “Promoting Energy Efficiency in Public Buildings in Uzbekistan”

**Date:** October 6, 2009

**Time:** 10:00-11:00 a.m.

**Venue:** State Committee for Architecture and Construction, Tashkent, Uzbekistan Conference Room

The purpose of the LPAC meeting was to review the UNDP GEF Project Proposal “Promoting Energy Efficiency in Public Buildings in Uzbekistan”, obtain feedback from national partners and seek partner endorsement for the project.

**Mr. Botir Hodjaev, Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of Uzbekistan, and Chairman of the State Committee for Agriculture and Construction of the Republic of Uzbekistan (LPAC Chair)** welcomed participants to the meeting. In his introductory and welcome remarks Mr. B. Khodjaev outlined the Government priorities for energy efficiency, use of renewable energy sources of energy and the importance of considering environmental factors in building design and construction. He thanked UNDP for the ongoing and proposed collaboration.

**Ms. Anita Nirody, UN RC and UNP RR in Uzbekistan** welcomed participants to the meeting. She raised the critical importance of the project for Uzbekistan. Sustainable management of energy and energy efficiency are a critical component of the Government’s Anti-Crisis programme which is being implemented in response to the financial crisis – hence this project is very timely. The project in addition to its immediate goals will also contribute to addressing challenges related to climate change and the focus on public buildings especially education and health facilities will add value to medical care and training activities aimed at the younger generation and in helping patients. She extended her strong appreciation for the efforts of the national institutions in project formulation efforts and thanked Mr. Khodjaev for his strong commitment and support to the project.

**A brief presentation of the project** was made by Mr. Janpolat Kudaybergenov, Project Manager of the project preparatory grant (PPG) stage. In his presentation Mr. Kudaybergenov provided a brief overview of proposed project objectives and highlighted issues related to the partnership strategy, scope of activities to be implemented, target outputs to be achieved as well as project implementation, monitoring and evaluation strategies.

#### Discussion.

Question/Comment	Answer
1. <b>Mr. B. Hodjaev:</b> a) Would it be possible to include one more component to the project to study availability of local construction materials, e.g. mineral wool insulation. That would contribute to analysis of materials can be used for construction of energy efficient	<b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> Such project activity is already included into the project component #3. A national consultant will be hired to study the local market for energy efficient materials and equipment. However, more focus will be given and more resources will be allocated to

<p>buildings.</p> <p>b) Does UNDP have any similar experience on Energy Efficiency?</p>	<p>this activity during the project implementation phase based on the suggestion made.</p> <p><b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> Actually, similar UNDP-GEF medium-sized projects is implemented in Kyrgyzstan. Kazakhstan has an ongoing project preparatory stage related to energy efficient buildings (residential ones) but similar projects will be initiated soon in Turkmenistan and Armenia.</p>
<p><b>Mr. S. Rashidov:</b> In summer time air cooling systems (air conditioners) consume a large amount of electrical energy, therefore, how this problem will be tackled within the project?</p>	<p><b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> This problem will be addressed during the project course. Some potential technical solutions such as natural ventilation system for building to be tested and demonstrated.</p>
<p><b>Mr. T. Kambarov:</b> Will you use the national examination bodies for the assessment and approval of the pilot buildings' design developed based on the integrated approach?</p>	<p><b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> The national examination bodies will be requested to assess the pilot buildings' design. A new jointly Department for energy efficient building code to be established within the State Committee for Architecture and Construction will be deeply involved in this process as well.</p>
<p><b>Mr. S. Rashidov:</b> Did you make any analysis potential options for greenhouse gas emission reduction to mitigate the climate change challenge?</p>	<p><b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> In Uzbekistan, public buildings in urban areas are heated using the district heating system that doesn't allow an accurate measurement of GHG emissions. However, project will be focusing on autonomous heating system mainly used in rural areas, and actual greenhouse gas emissions reduction potential will be measured.</p>
	<p>Comments:</p> <p><b>Mr. T. Nasirov:</b> The project is of the particular importance for overall nationwide energy saving strategy. The strategy comprises a national program on energy efficiency will be based on application of standards for specific power and natural gas consumption. Tashkent city municipality has already piloting introduction of such norms and standards. In this context, proposed project shall focus on strengthening legal and regulatory frameworks enforcing efficient use of energy resources. As energy consumption will be growing because of demographic growth, this tendency shall be properly tackled</p>

<p><b>Ms. Yana Chicherina:</b> Within the UNDP ACCESS project, we work on equal access for people with disabilities (PWD) to buildings. Do you consider any activity aimed at design of buildings friendly to the PWD?</p>	<p><b>Mr. J. Kydaybergenov:</b> Design and construction standards, and also technical solutions provided equal access for PWD to public buildings, namely schools and hospitals, will be definitely focused on and introduced within the project.</p> <p><b>Mr. M. Achilov:</b> The State Committee for Architecture and Construction has already developed a draft of a government resolution/order ensuring technical solutions that facilitate access of PWD to public buildings.</p>
<p><b>Mr. R. Hudonazarov:</b> We support this project and believe it would be very useful. We would suggest include sites (schools and/or hospitals) located in remote and isolated areas into the scope of project demonstration activities.</p>	<p><b>Mr. B. Hodjaev:</b> Thanks for your support and a good proposal.</p>
<p><b>Mr. E. Iskandarov:</b> Can residential buildings be also a subject of the project activities? Can renewable energy applications, e.g. use of wind and solar energy, be also considered by the project?</p>	<p><b>Mr. B. Hodjaev:</b> The project will focus on the integrated approach to design and construction of public buildings, including sites located in rural areas. As far utilization of renewable energy sources, potential for wind energy is still to be more studied and researched as actually wind turbines can be used at very limited scale comparing with solar energy solutions. To elaborate renewable energy applications, a separate project will be required.</p>
<p><b>Mr. M. Zahidov:</b> In the project preparatory grant phase the current consumption of energy has been estimated in the range of 350-400 kWh/year but the relevant norm in Europe is 110. Uzbek norms have to be reduced at least twice. To address this piloting of passive solar house is implemented in rural area. Monitoring demonstrates that such house can be 100% heated using solar energy. We will be looking for opportunities to work together with the proposed project and exchange the experience gained.</p>	<p><b>Mr. B. Hodjaev:</b> Thank you for the comment</p>
<p><b>Mr. B. Hodjaev:</b> If there are no other comments, let us endorse the proposed project and confirm that we are ready to sign the Project Document.</p>	<p><b>Mr. J. Kudaybergenov:</b> LPAC minutes shall be send first to the Bratislava Regional Centre to submit to GEF, and upon their acceptance and approval Project Document will be submitted</p>

for signature.

Summarizing this part of the LPAC meeting the participants agreed the comments and additions would be included in project proposal and approved by Project Board during the inception phase of the project.

#	Question of the PAC check list	Opinions of the participants
1.	Relevance	Affirmative.
2.	Stakeholder participation and partnership-building	Affirmative. All key stakeholders are involved and more partners can be included during the project implementation.
3.	Contribution to poverty reduction.	Affirmative. The project will ensure sustainable use of natural resources and creation of 'green' jobs.
4.	Gender equality and the advancement of women	Affirmative. TORs of the project positions will state that female candidates with similar qualifications will be given priority.
5.	Protection and regeneration of the environment	Affirmative.
6.	Feasibility and technical soundness.	Affirmative. There are new technical solutions on energy efficient equipment and renewable energy would be employed in the project.
7.	Management arrangements	Affirmative.
8.	Integration, synergies, complementary	Affirmative.
9.	Result orientation	Affirmative.
10.	Resources and inputs	Affirmative.
11.	Governance	Affirmative.
12.	Most promising strategy (risks and external factors)	The Risk Log is provided in the project document.
13.	Incorporation of lessons learned	Affirmative
14.	Capacity development and sustainability	Affirmative

#### Conclusion:

**Mr. Botir Hodjaev:** Thanked UNDP and colleagues for this initiative and stressed Government commitment to provide the necessary support, resources and expertise available for efficient project implementation made. We are glad to work together with you and ready to provide our resources and expertise for the efficient project implementation. Thanks to all of you.

**Ms. Anita Nirody:** Thanked Mr. Hodjaev and participants for their valuable comments. She stressed the need for the project to use the experience and expertise already available locally, and highlighted important features of the project including bringing in global good practices in energy efficiency to this project in Uzbekistan as well as the needed for a strong and inclusive partnership strategy.

#### LPAC decision and immediate follow-up actions

The LPAC noted the comments of participants and endorsed the project. The next steps outlined were the following:

1. Submit minutes to UNDP Bratislava Regional Centre for endorsement to obtain the Delegation of Authority
2. Submit the Project Document to the State Committee for Architecture and Construction of the Republic of Uzbekistan for signature.
3. Launch the project as soon as the project document is signed and hold the inception workshop within the first month of project implementation ensuring timely project personnel recruitment.



**Mr. Abduvakkos Abdurahmanov**  
**Head of Environment and Energy Unit**  
**UNDP CO in Uzbekistan**

**Representatives of Ministries and Agencies:**

1. Mr. Botir Hodjaev, Chairman, State Committee for Architecture and Construction of Uzbekistan, Deputy Prime Minister of the Republic of Uzbekistan
2. Mr. Achilov, National Project Coordinator, Deputy Chairman of the State Committee for Architecture and Construction of Uzbekistan
3. Mr. N. Vladimirov, Head of Technical Department, Tashjilproekt project
4. Mr. H. Pirmatov, Dean of Faculty, Tashkent Automobile Road Construction Institute
5. Mr. R. Marakaev, Professor, Tashkent Automobile Road Construction Institute
6. Mr. P. Kovrejenkov, Senior Specialist, State company 'Suvsanoatfuqaro'
7. Mr. T. Nosirov, Director, EnergoCenter of Uzbekistan
8. Mr. G. Karko, Senior Specialist, Ministry of Economy of Uzbekistan
9. Mr. I. Mansurov, Director of Private Construction Company
10. Mr. N. Mamadov, Head of Department, Ministry of Public Education of Uzbekistan
11. Mr. N. Oqilov, Senior Inspector, Ministry of Public Education of Uzbekistan
12. Mr. V. Beskorovayniy, Senior Specialist, Rural Construction Project
13. Ms. M. Jandinova, Senior Specialist, Rural Construction Project
14. Mr. A. Sheraliev, Senior Specialist, Aral Basin Genofond Fund
15. Mr. M. Zahidov, Architect, Solaro IV project
16. Mr. N. Mahamatov, Ministry of Higher Education of Uzbekistan
17. Mr. A. Katulin, Head of Department, State company 'Uzshaharsozlik'
18. Mr. U. Ilhamov, Specialist, State company 'Uzshaharsozlik'
19. Ms. V. Manoylenko, Deputy Chairman, State company 'Uzmevasabzavotloyiha'
20. Mr. R. Hudoynazarov, Senior Inspector, Ministry of Public Education of Uzbekistan
21. Mr. S. Rashidov, Head of Department, State Committee for Architecture and Construction of Uzbekistan
22. Mr. T. Kambarov, Head of Assessment Department, State Committee for Architecture and Construction of Uzbekistan
23. Mr. E. Iskandarov, Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Uzbekistan

**UNDP:**

1. Ms. Anita Nirody, UN Resident Coordinator and UNDP Resident Representative
2. Ms. Aziza Umarova, Head of Good Governance Unit
3. Ms. Rano Baykhanova, Climate Change Specialist, Environment and Energy Unit
4. Mr. Farhod Maksudov, Environment Specialist, Environment and Energy Unit
5. Mr. Makhmud Shaumarov, Programme Associate, Environment and Energy Unit
6. Mr. Janpolat Kudaybergenov, Project Manager, Project Preparation Grant for the "Energy Efficiency in Public Buildings in Uzbekistan" Project
7. Ms. Yana Chicherina, Project Manager, Project "ACCESS" to support PWD
8. Mr. Oleg Basov, National Technical Coordinator, "Capacity Building for Clean Development Mechanism in Uzbekistan" Project